
Insights' Ethics Challenge [1 – 47]
Year 2014

Prepared by:

LuV

Table of Contents

4 th July 2014	3
5 th July 2014	4
7 th July 2014	6
8 th July 2014	8
9 th July 2014	10
10 th July 2014	11
11 th July 2014	12
12 th July 2014	13
13 th July 2014	14
15 th July 2014	15
16 th July 2014	17
17 th July 2014	17
18 th July 2014	19
19 th July 2014	20
21 st July 2014.....	21
22 nd July 2014.....	22
23 rd July 2014	22
24 th July 2014	23
25 th July 2014	24
26 th July 2014.....	26
27 th July 2014	26
30 th July 2014	28
31 st July 2014.....	29
1 st Aug 2014	30
2 nd Aug 2014.....	31
5 th August 2014	31
6 th August 2014	32
7 th July 2014	33
28 th Aug 2014	34
30 th August 2014.....	36
31 st Aug 2014	37
1 st Sept 2014	39
2 nd Sept 2014.....	40

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

3 rd Sept 2014	43
5 th Sept 2014	44
6 th September 2014	45
10 th Sept 2014	46
11 th Sept 2014	48
12 th Sept 2014	49
13 th Sept 2014	50
15 th Sept 2014	51
17 th Sept 2014	52
19 th Sept 2014	53
20 th Sept 2014	54
29 th Sept 2014	56
4 th Oct 2014.....	57

4th July 2014

Q1).What do you understand by the following terms in the context of private life?

- Commitment
- Integrity

Ans:

a) Commitment: - As the word itself says, Commitment means to commit oneself for a particular cause, promise, act, love or adventure. This becomes important in private life, because commitment brings surety, co-operation and will power to any act. Example - Committed persons towards social causes are needed in Bureaucracy to bring social justice, good governance, upliftment of deprived sections of society and poor.

b) Integrity: - Integrity means maintaining one's own honest and impartial behaviour. It means being whole or complete in terms of ethical morals, values – aesthetic and spiritual and principles. It is opposite of Hypocrisy in which person's say something and do something else opposite to what they preach. So, integrity means doing what you say, that is maintaining promise or commitment

Q2) You are stranded in traffic in your car. You are driving the car. A poor girl looking very frail approaches you and start begging for money. Looking at he frail appearance, out of compassion, you take out your wallet to search for a ten Rupees note. The girl who is standing very near to you snatches the wallet and starts running. A man on a motorbike

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

who see this act, catches the girl and starts beating her in full view of public. Now the traffic is moving and your car is in the middle of the road.

What will you do in such a situation? And why? (250 Words)

Ans:

The situation demands an immediate act of compassion to protect that young girl without causing much discomfort i.e. is traffic block.

A pragmatic approach would be to drive the car and park the car along the road side.

Immediate rush to the man and stop him from beating the girl in full public view. Thanking him for taking notice of the theft and taking action, but simultaneously reminding him that the girl is very young and could have acted out of hunger too. Remind him gently that it is a public space and such act physical violence could land him in legal trouble. This should lower his anger.

Thanking him again, convey that you would take the necessary future course of action.

Following, I would park the car in a better parking space along, besides taking the girl along with you. Get her something to eat and drink, ask her why she acted so. Tell her you won't harm her.

Call and inform the authorised govt agency or an NGO working in the field of child welfare and hand her over to them. These agencies are obliged to take the right course of action for the betterment of the child.

I would make an occasional follow up of the girl with the agency to whom I had handed over her to.

5th July 2014

Q1). Do you agree with the view that values deteriorate as societies economically prosper and move towards materialism? Critically comment. (200 Words)

Ans 1:

Technology has made man rational. He is far too obdurate now than in the ancient times to accept things that fails in the test of reasonability. Puranas and the Upanishad which were considered the source of morality in oriental societies have been relegated. Man has begun to question the very 'truth' behind them. The notion of right and wrong / good or bad/evil or divine has been replaced with true and false(0 or 1).

The passion for material possession and profit oriented market structure has made man one dimensional. A multidimensional man has just become consumer of utility but besides having material needs man has social, psychological needs too.

These multifarious interests have prevented the complete moral degradation of man. Policies and laws of the state too are based on certain moral foundation. Economic prosperity and growth is considered incomplete if it is devoid of human development. Human rights are given more superiority than the rights guaranteed by the State.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

Any violation of these rights is considered as the crime against humanity. Societies have realised the impact of rampant economic growth on the ecology and environment. There is wide consensus among the societies of the world to consider green GDP and Gross National Happiness as indices of economic prosperity.

Societies in modern States too are based on certain moral principles. These social norms are primarily based on the notion of right and wrong. These notions act as a restraint on man and prevent him from doing anything that goes against the social norms. The 'regime of truth' that every society creates around itself has kept alive the moral spirit in man despite his crave for material possession.

Ans2:

As societies are prospering economically, materialism and consumerism are becoming the order of the day. Humanness has reduced in every walk of life- peoples and nations have been reduced to consumers and markets, real conversations have been replaced by chats and comments.

With the advent of nuclear families, the familial values have seen a setback. Elderly increasingly feel neglected as children are too busy focusing on salary hikes. Schools and colleges have started focusing more on rote learning to ensure a spot for students in placements, the importance of sports and value education has decreased.

Corporate sector trains its employees to treat people as clients, agents, customers with the sole aim of profit maximization. With the societal institutions steering focus away from morals, values are bound to deteriorate. However, situation is not all grim. Fortunately, we still have voices advocating for a pause in the mindless race for economic development- to think about rehabilitation of people being displaced by some project and its negative effect on environment, to care for the elderly and downtrodden, to take up the cause of absolving our society of corrupt practices. What is required is these voices are heard and paid heed to more often.

Q2). You are posted as Superintendent of Police to a District. The stenographer, a beautiful young lady who is smart and hard working, grows close to you. You take her assistance in many office tasks. In the office and beyond a rumour spreads that you are having an affair with her. To make things worse the stenographer has confessed to her friends in office that she loves you. You are affectionate towards her but you are faithful to your wife. You do not worry about rumours and carry on with your work meanwhile growing more close to stenographer. Your wife comes to know about these rumours. A point is reached where the stenographer becomes powerful in the office thanks to your close association. Your continued association is straining your relationship with your wife and is also affecting your public image.

What will you do in these circumstances? Which values would you uphold most in such a scenario and explain why **(250 Words)**

Ans:

In these circumstances, the foremost thing that I will do is to -

i) talk to her personally and letting her know about the consequences of this kind of confession in a work place, which is against the code of conduct of any department. Will try to make her understand that this is not only going to affect personal life but it will hamper one's self-respect, honor, integrity. Neither she nor I will be able to do work in a peaceful manner, where rumors keep on spreading like wildfire.

By directly letting her know that, since I am married and I am loyal and faithful to my wife and trust being one of the most important aspect of one's married life, this kind of relationship will directly affect each other's life as in this case it is affecting me.

I will try to make her understand that she is young and beautiful, and this might be just an infatuation and nothing more than that.

ii) Second option would be to talk in front of my wife. This will also clear all the rumours that she might have been hearing. A direct face to face meeting along with my wife will help her understand the situation more clearly.

iii) Last option, if the above two does not work, would be to hold a meeting with all the colleagues and subordinates, explain them the situation, clear up the air and meanwhile, let stenographer know of the consequences and transfer her to a another post.

7th July 2014

Q1) Suppose you are sitting on the seat of a crowded local train, you saw an old lady standing near you and then you offered her your seat but before she could take the seat a man took the seat and the man was aware that you had offered your seat to that old lady. In such a situation how will you manage the same seat for her? **(150 Words)**

Ans:

Suppose you are sitting on the seat of a crowded local train, you saw an old lady standing near you and then you offered her your seat but before she could take the seat a man took the seat and the man was aware that you had offered your seat to that old lady. In such a situation how will you manage the same seat for her?

As train is overcrowded and there will be nobody to pay attention to such a repeated incidents in train which for the regular commuter is routine, It will be futile to try out to divert the attention of crowd to the incident happened. Since Man was aware about that I was offering a seat to old lady then also he grabbed it, it may have two possibilities.

- He is not feeling well

If so I will ask whether he needs any further help? Does he need to inform to his family or to his family doctor etc and if he advises I will do so and will ensure that some of his relative comes him to pick up. I will take his contact number and will enquire about him in free time.

- He just grabbed without any justifiable reason

Then I will ask him to offer it to old lady since she is in much need than us. If he defies then I will try to emotionally console him by saying "Imagine she is like your mother or she is like your sister" and if someone does like this with your mother or sister will you accept it??

And country like India where mother has a special respect in everyone's heart will not be so cruel to refuse any help to motherly figure

Q2) You are a father of 7 year old girl. You are living in a flat with your wife and daughter. You are working in high profile job in an MNC. Your boss is your close friend and because of him you have landed a good job. You also owe him lots of money. If it was not for him, you would have continued in less paying old job. Your boss frequently visits your flat. He is close to your daughter and wife. One day, your daughter complains that your boss did something unnatural to her in her bedroom. He actually sexually molested your daughter. What will you do now? In the light of laws of the land, human rights and personal ethics, suggest a course of action that you should take. **(250 Words)**

Ans:

Sexual offences against children are rapidly increasing and it's our moral responsibility to ensure the perpetrators are punished accordingly. Often ignored fearing society, these incidents continue to haunt the children for many years and have an adverse impact on their mental/psychological growth.

First of all I would try to release the mental trauma my daughter has undergone. I would tell her that she has done a courageous job by informing us and tell her not to hesitate telling anything which occurs to her as unnatural. I would tell my wife to help her get back to normal state of mind.

Then I would go to my boss's house and strictly tell him to come with me to police station. If he hesitates I shall threaten him of filing an FIR under POCSO Act. On reaching police station, I shall narrate the entire incident, and ask police to get a written declaration from him stating that he is accepting his offence and if repeated again against anybody he shall be liable to rigorous legal action. Next step will be to raise an alarm in his neighbourhood as well, to ensure if he has victimized other children or not.

Written declaration with dire consequences will prevent him from exploiting some other child.

Q3) Critically comment on the ethical issues involved in the climate change negotiations held by developing and developed countries. **(200 Words)**

Reference 1: <http://www.theeuropean-magazine.com/james-garvey/7693-the-ethics-of-climate-change>

Reference 2: <http://www.eenews.net/stories/1059997597>

Ans 1:

Climate change is a matter which is deeper than institutional or personal concerns. In the last 300 years the environment has undergone such a radical change that it can be termed anthropogenic epoch, which naturally would have taken thousands of years. It involves 4 parties which are developed countries, developing countries, least developed countries and innocent bystanders which include future generations, flora and fauna of earth.

The developed countries must admit to share but differential responsibilities as a matter of justice keeping in mind their exploitation of resources in the past. There is a huge inequity in sharing of resources both at spatial and temporal leading to social and economic inequalities.

As a matter of right and not entitlements poor people in developing and least developed countries have a right to live in safe environment as they are not passive receiver but an active agent of using nature gifts. This not only extends to humans but also to flora and fauna having an inherent right to share the same. Climate change is chief cause of extinction of various species. Further intergenerational equity must be ensured keeping in mind responsibilities are not limited to intergeneration but also to intergenerations.

The third issue is classical dilemma between growth and sustainability. The growth must be checked by balance and equal distribution of resources.

On the developing countries part there is need to show reciprocity and enlightened national interest which means well being of others will translate into own well being. Only a shared approach can ensure resolutions to these ethical problems.

Ans2:

Incessant economic growth has taken a toll on the fragile ecosystem of the mother earth. Nature treats all its creature equally. It bestows the love upon us equally. Similarly we all have to bear the wrath of nature when an attempt is made to disturb the balance it maintains.

The benefit accrued by one at the cost of nature becomes a bane of the entire community. Climatic change negotiations are centered around sharing of responsibility of the global community to restore the balance of nature. Early industrialisation of the developed economy and poverty of the developing and poor countries are the major determinants that frame the climate change negotiations.

It's true that the rapid pace of industrialisation and the rush for technological development in advanced economy has gradually disturbed the natural balance that the earth maintains. One of the major reasons of poverty of the developing nations is also due to the long history of colonial exploitation of its resources to quench the thirst of big industries of the imperial powers.

The very principal of common but differentiated responsibilities emerges from this too. Developing countries have not remained aloof from the desire of industrial advancement. The materialistic move acquired a faster pace everytime nations enter into a new generation. The forces of globalisation has assured that boundaries are diffused and nations are part of one global community and the communitarian theory of Right states that each individual should enjoy the right which is consonance with the welfare of the entire community.

Human being by nature is materialistic. He loves to possess and acquire. The same nature governs the international policies. Maintenance of balance of power and theory of deterrence have involved world community in a mad race of nuclear weapon, either done covertly or overtly.

Sadly, no regard is given to the nature when this is done. Deadlock that happens at climatic change negotiations is a manifestation of the rigidity of the global community to accept that, we as a part of the community, a family writ large, bear equal responsibility. The principle of differentiated responsibility for the weaker members should not be imposed upon the community but should be accepted with alacrity for the sake of welfare of all.

8th July 2014

Q1) You are a Probationary Officer in a Public Sector Bank and you have been transferred to a branch located in Naxal affected area. On the very first day, while returning from work, you were stopped by a Naxal group. They sought 25% of your salary as 'protection money' which should be paid every month, and if you fail, you will be killed by the group without offering you any second chance. You are an IAS aspirant managing your preparation along with the work pressure. You are from a very poor family and this job has brought a ray of hope to you and your parents. You are unmarried though.

The local police is aware of this Naxal problem, which is common in the region, yet they are not taking any action for fear of their own lives and corruption.

What will be your course of action in this circumstance ? (250 Words)

Ans:

Following options are before me:-

1. i accept their demand
2. i don't accept

1st option:

It is not right because it would fund their illegal activities and also it would encourage them to demand further. Again, personally it would create problems if 25% is given because of poor financial situation in my family.

2nd option:

first thing would be to ask other employees whether they are facing same problem or not. If others are facing same problem, i would try to jointly demand higher bank authorities to arrange safer transport facility for work and also protection around the workplace and residences. Also, i would write to higher authorities in police and administration about apathy of local police.

If I find that i am being targeted alone, then i would firstly request such groups to leave me alone. If it doesn't work, i would ask higher authorities to provide safe transport and residence because these things can affect my performance in workplace. I would request for a transfer if nothing works out because i have a right to safe working condition.

Q2) On completion of probationary training as an IAS probationary officer, you are posted as Assistant Commissioner (Deputy Collector) to a Sub Division of a district. To ensure probity and transparency in your office, what steps would you take immediately? Explain. (200 Words)

Ans:

1. Eliminating middle men – A person himself or kin should come to get things done
2. Commitment - Based on the interactions with the ground staff, for each of the actions performed, a pre-defined time would be set. (E.g. for issue of new ration card, it will take 7 working days).
3. Tracker - Internal: For each department, an internal document will be maintained. Like when the application was received, what action, when it has been moved to the next staff and the acknowledgement from the next staff. Would try to make this tracker available to general public through state IT department
4. Open tenders: On all the contracts that are in my control/advisable limit, would be taken towards open tenders, if possible online tenders.
5. Accountability: Would set up a small team to collect the redressal claims. Frequently

complained staffs would be enquired and memo would be dispatched where needed.

6. Educate: Through media, would educate citizens on the steps taken, and the role of collectorate.

To make sure these are not misused against staffs, frequent checks and auditing will be done in person.

9th July 2014

Q1) What do you understand by political attitudes? Examine the factors that have shaped political attitudes in India. **(200 Words)**

Reference

Ans:

Political attitude attributes the way our environment and society is viewed in terms of accommodation and sharing of Political space. As Political space exhibit power to empower and ameliorate deprivation, marginalization and concerns, Political attitude exhibit important place.

Our Political attitude is shaped by various factors:

- 1) Historical Mindset: Patriarchal, Inequality, Resistance to change
- 2) Society: Caste domination, Fraternity
- 3) Freedom struggle: Equality, Secular, Socialist. Democratic
- 4) Awareness: Individual rights
- 5) Education
- 6) Global factors: Attitude towards various institutions

Political attitude plays a transformative role in the development and progress of a nation.

Q2) Shraddha recently landed a well paying software job in a reputed company in Bangalore. She has an ambition to become a civil servant. She is working hard towards it. Recently she wrote the entrance for Prime Minister's Rural Development Fellowship (PMRDF) and got selected as its Fellow. Though she received better salary in the present job, she wanted to accept the PMRD Fellowship and work for it. She will be posted in a far away state from her present location. The district where she will be posted is a sensitive region severely affected by Naxal problem. Few days ago, few civil servants and policemen were killed by Naxals in an ambush.

Shraddha's parents do not want her to leave the present job. Her boyfriend with whom her marriage is fixed is also not supporting her. She thinks that this fellowship would equip her with skills needed to work as an IAS officer in case she gets selected in future.

- a. If you are in Shraddha's place, what decision will you take? Give reasons. **(150 Words)**
- b. Do you think it's right on her boyfriend's and parents' part to say no to her decision? Critically comment. **(100 Words)**

Ans:

a). Here is conflict between shradha's commitment and her personal life. As shradha is already doing a job and getting good salary despite of that she want to be an ias officer meaning she is not satisfied and want to achieve ias and she has also been doing hard work for that.

So if i was at shradha place i would stand by with my decision and talk with my parents and boy friend and tell them about goal of my life, my aspiration and usefulness of this fellowship job in getting the skill and experiences which would be helpful in doing my job as an ias officer and inform them as an ias officer also i can be posted in a Naxalite area. So i can't escape from the situation and it is part and parcel of my ultimate goal and this will help me in future in dealing with Naxalite problem so this way i would convinced them that how important the job is for me and ask them to allow me to go.

b). Parents will generally say 'no' to such a decision as they would like no risk to their ward's life. As they have given birth, they are very protective, especially of a girl child, in Indian context. This is justified on their part as it is their natural reaction. They only need to be lovingly coaxed by telling about her ambition, giving full assurance that Government of India will give full security, and that she would always be in touch with them by phone.

Yet, one would expect the boyfriend being of same generation to understand the dreams of Shradha. He should be more broad-minded in this case, as even in future if she became an IAS officer and got posted in Naxal districts, she would have to handle it! So he should rather support her from now onwards in her decisions.

10th July 2014

Q1) Write a note on the basic Human Values. Critically comment on the role of educational institutions in inculcating these values, especially in the context of Indian education system. (200 Words)

Reference

Ans:

Human values refer to the universal set of norms, custom, tradition present across world. They transcend the social and geographical boundary. They are more related to emotional aspect rather than based on objective criteria. They include static aspect as well as dynamic aspect.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

The basic human values are:- Self Direction, Motivation, Conformity, Security, Power, Achievement, Benevolence, Hedonism, Tradition and Universalism. In these values conformity, security and tradition can be termed as Conservation, Achievement and Power as self enhancement and Universalism and Benevolence as Self Transcendence.

Indian Education System has been focused on inculcating values based on self transcendence such as Benevolence and Universalism. Historical factor are responsible for Indian education system focusing on these values. At times education system has been criticized for focusing on rote learning thereby not giving enough opportunity for motivation and self direction.

The lack of education on these values has been termed as responsible for so called “Hindu rate of growth”. There is also need for focussing on values such as conformity and tradition to preserve India’s cultural heritage.

Indian Education system has shifted its focus on universalism by implementing no examination in the junior class. This is likely lead to enhance values of stimulation and self direction.

Q2) “In law a man is guilty when he violates the rights of others. In ethics he is guilty if he only thinks of doing so.” – Immanuel Kant.

Bring out the meaning of the above quote with examples. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

An action is considered unethical when it harms an individual other than self. Ethics and laws both strive towards larger public interest, but ethics are subjective while laws are objective in nature.

Ethics are hence at the individual level, and they play a definitive role in guiding one's actions. A person who thinks of harming someone, knowing that it's consequences is indeed unethical. Unethical thoughts usually turn into illegal actions in most cases. However both laws and ethics both try to protect rights of people, while laws are imposed upon people, ethics are innate and prevents one from harming another individual. Laws may not prevent the actions of an individual all the time but ethic can.

Laws can also build certain ethics in a society. Abortion may not be unethical for an individual who cannot afford to raise a child, but it is indeed violating the right to life of a child. Hence both ethics and laws are important to make a society peaceful and prosperous.

11th July 2014

Q1) You are working as an employee in a private company. One afternoon in the office you get a frantic call from your wife that your two year old daughter is very ill and her condition is critical. Unfortunately nobody is there around to help your wife in any way. Your car is

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

the only option to take your daughter to the hospital, you have to rush to help your daughter as soon as possible.

You soon leave the office. On your way back home you hit an old woman and she is critically injured and before you notice she dies. Nobody has noticed the accident as it has taken place on a stretch of road that's always free of traffic and people. Your wife is calling you frantically for the help. Any delay would cost your daughter's life.

- a. In this scenario what will you do? And why? **(150 Words)**
- b. Examine the rules, laws and values which come into the picture in the above scenario. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

Driving in an emotionally charged state has caused death of an ailing old lady. Since the lady is already dead and my daughter is struggling for life my immediate step would be to ensure that my daughter's life is not lost because of my emotionally charged reaction towards the dead lady.

I will call the police and tell them about the accident and give them my personal details. Law demands that the dead body should not be displaced to determine the exact cause of death. So without disturbing the dead body i will drive to my home and take my daughter to the nearest hospital. My next step after ensuring her treatment would be to submit myself to the nearest police station.

This is a case of culpable homicide not amounting to murder for which bail is an available remedy is the culprit submits to law. My submission and cooperation with police will earn me a bail immediately. So i can take care of my daughter. I will also inquire about the family of the dead lady to explain them the cause of accident and seek pardon for my own self satisfaction. I will also offer them some monetary help if they are poor. Rest i will leave to the court to decide.

12th July 2014

Q1) You have been shortlisted for the UPSC Civil Services Personality Test i.e. Interview. On the day of your interview, when your turn comes you enter the interview hall with a calm and confident composure. On entering the board you immediately notice that a lady sitting next to the Chairman is your favourite professor from the college from where you completed your graduation. You were very close to her and she too was fond of you. In fact she had treated you like her own son. In the hall she too notices you but neither smiles at you nor does her body language suggests anything that shows she is familiar to you. The Chairman asks you to sit and the interview is about to begin.

- a. Do you think it is ethical to continue your interview with the same board? Substantiate your answer. **(150 Words)**

Ans:

The dilemma here is that the lady may, being familiar with the interviewee, be biased towards him. But body language says all. She did not acknowledge that she knows you and this is very well an indication that she is very rightly aware about her job. Moreover, before being inducted into interview panel they are trained not to favour anybody and go by the performance of the candidate in the interview.

In addition to that, you are being familiar to a member of interview panel is not your fault. Further, one option is to request for change the interview board. But that would be highly inappropriate because in that case you have doubt on the integrity of the interviewer. So, I would perform to best of my capacity in the interview and will hope for the best

Q2) You are walking on a footpath in a crowded market. You notice that a person is lying unconscious on the footpath. He appears to be injured on his head. Every person is ignoring him and they passing by without even looking at him. As you approach nearer to the laying person, you notice that he's actually murmuring something in pain and strong smell of alcohol is emanating from him.

What will you do in this situation? Explain why. **(150 Words)**

Ans:

The situation reminds me of a quote of Mahatma Gandhi, "Hate sin not the sinner". The person lying on the footpath is having a head injury and needs immediate medical care. Despite disliking alcoholism I will immediately try to help him.

My first step would be to call an ambulance to take him to the nearest hospital. By the time the ambulance arrives I will try to hear what he is murmuring and react accordingly if he is suggesting the name of somebody to be informed. I will also check his pocket to get any identity proof to call his relatives.

13th July 2014

Case Study

You are walking home from your work. There is a railway track nearby, which bifurcates some distance away from your home. While on your way you notice that four women have been tied to the tracks. A goods train is approaching fast. Some distance away you notice that your daughter is walking on the other track which is actually a bridge, below which a deep gorge is located. There is an option to save all five women by changing the route of the train to other track. If you do so, you will kill your daughter. Your daughter has no escape option. She is unaware of any of these developments as she is walking blissfully listening to her favourite songs from iPod from her headphones. That track on the bridge is not used by trains owing to some reasons.

You can not run and untie all five women as it's impossible to do so without risking your life. If you do so, you will also get killed along with the five women.

In this situation, what will you do? And explain why. **(150 Words)**

Ans:

As it is given that there is a deep gorge below the second track on the bridge and also that track is not used by the trains so diverting the train on that track will risk the lives of the train driver, conductor and other railway staffs on board as well as my daughter walking on the same track.

Not taking any action is also not even worth considering as i can never forgive myself for this inaction throughout my life and also it is not justifiable by any philosophical consideration. Since the train is approaching fast so i do not have enough time to untie women and save them that too risking my life which will mean end to every hope of saving the endangered lives.

Also as i am returning from office it might be dark all around but the fact that i can see five women tied on the track and my daughter walking on the other track proves it wrong and indicates it is yet visible.

So the best i could do is to follow the principle of Nishkam Karma i.e. perform my duty with detachment by trying to stop the train by waving my cloth in hand and through panic body gestures so that the driver or other staff on the train could see me(as it is yet visible outside) and stop the train

15th July 2014

Q1) You are a Collector of a district. The Chief Minister has arrived to attend a private function and at the same time has summoned all officials to get reports on various works in progress in the district. Your family was also invited by the organisers of this private function. Because of some issues at home, you arrive half an hour late to the function where meeting is also being held by the CM.

The CM, who is known for ill temper, soundly abuses you in front of all dignitaries, your wife and children. You are insulted and humiliated in full public glare. This was your first such experience.

How will you react? Explain and give reasons. **(150 Words)**

Ans:

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

At that instance, several emotions would be running through my mind like embarrassment, ego, frustration, guilt etc. The first thing I would do is manage my emotions because such emotions could lead to taking ill decisions. Instead would try to use them to act accordingly.

Secondly, I would apologise to the Chief Minister and all the other officials as I have wasted their time. As being the head of the district, I should be the first person to intimate the CM about the happenings in the district, so my delay is not pardonable.

Thirdly, I would request him to calm down and would explain the reason for my delay. If I don't then I would be setting a bad precedent to all the other officials.

Q2) Ravi and Ramya, a newly married couple, have joined same company as software engineers. They are put under a same team leader. The team leader has started flirting with Ravi's wife. He has also started giving trouble to Ravi in terms of putting him under lot of work related pressure. Both Ravi and Ramya have signed contract with the company.

Ravi is now asking Ramya to leave the job and stay at home. Ramya is just friendly with the team leader, and she thinks he is harmless. Though she has told Ravi about this, Ravi wants her to leave the job at any cost. After few months Ramya got promotion whereas Ravi didn't. She is made team leader of another team and she now reports to manager who was her former team leader. These developments have further depressed Ravi and lately he has started doubting his wife. However, Ramya has always been faithful to Ravi.

If you were in Ravi's and Ramya's place, what would you do respectively? (200 Words)

Ans:

The most important factor for a marriage is trust, without trust bonding will just fade away. insecurities in personal relations especially husband and wife are part and parcel of it since one can be possessive, however this is not altogether wrong but insecurities with rising distrust can combine together to damage a relationship. A hallmark of a good relation is keeping dialogue open without personal bias affecting expression of feelings of each other.

As Ravi, i would like to openly convey to my wife about the insecurities i feel in her interaction with her boss and her subsequent promotion. I would also like to say to her i trust her lot and would only want good for her and was happy that she had got promotion, but i dint really trust the intent of her boss (my former TL) and therefore i would like her to trust me in my feelings and stay away from him since it was probably sending a wrong message to him, who was misinterpreting her friendly nature and also as it was damaging our personal relations due to my insecurities, if she wasn't ready to leave the job, as it would be best possible outcome.

As Ramya i would make my husband understand about my nature and my friendliness, which didn't mean anything more apart from just that. I would address my husband's insecurities by listening to him patiently and understanding it in the light of my recent promotion, it would only complicate his thought process.

Since i would not like to leave the job i would for one trust my husband and keep my interactions with boss to only professional level since it would inspire confidence in my husband. However to address his deeper bias against me i would give him a plain talk about

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

my freedom, integrity and choices, and the fact that his distrust will not help matters hence he should be more open to me interacting with male counterparts without any bias.

16th July 2014

Q1) You are a Block Development Officer. You have been invited by a Panchayat Secretary to attend the Gram Sabha meeting. The meeting has been called to allot houses to the poor with an aim to make this Panchayat free of huts. State government has sent you a strict direction to provide durable houses to all the needy and to make sure no village has a single hut anywhere.

In the meeting a very old widow approaches you and tells you that she is living in a hut which is dilapidated and is about to collapse. She has no one in the village and she is all alone and she is at the fag end of her life. When you are about to recommend her a house out of empathy, Panchayat Secretary reveals that she was allotted an house few years ago and that she had sold the house to pay her husband's debt. Some villagers who treat her as insane old widow also raise objections to grant her another house.

She is very old and she is almost begging you to help her. Selling her previous house was illegal as per Panchayat rules. She has nowhere to go. As per government's directive, she can't continue to live in a hut.

In this circumstance what decision will you take? Explain why. (200 Words)

Ans:

The situation involves an ethical dilemma involving the clash of two values i.e. objectivity and empathy. Objectivity demands me to deal the case as per the requirement of law and don't give that woman a house. Empathy will force me to allow the woman a house on exceptional grounds as she is very old.

As this is the first case of violation the entire village is looking at my judgement. If i allow the woman to have a new home it would exhort other people to break law and then seek a new house on grounds of emotional excuses creating a great deal of administrative problem. I will objectively follow the law and deny a new house to old lady.

Since its also a moral duty of state to take care of older peoples and being a representative of state i will look at options for her settlement. As older peoples have bonding with their residence i will look for a volunteer to keep the old lady with her.

I will ensure that volunteer that government benefits for old people will be given to the old lady so that she does not become a financial liability. If no one volunteers i will arrange a place for her in nearby old age home.

17th July 2014

Q1). You have passed UPSC Civil Services exam with a very good rank (Rank 10) and you have given first preference to IAS and your home state. You will get home cadre as you are

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

the topper from the state and there is vacancy available under your category. A former Chief Minister, who belongs to your caste, now wants to make you his Son-in-Law. Just like you, his daughter is also a graduate from top foreign university, she is very beautiful and as per information gathered from different sources by your parents, she is a down to earth and sweet girl.

The former Chief Minister is also the head of the political party he belongs to and there is every chance that he would become Chief Minister again if his party comes to power in next elections. Your parents are on cloud nine ever since this marriage offer has been proposed.

The former Chief Minister was jailed for few years in the past on corruption and murder charges. There are serious cases still pending against him in different courts. He is very rich. His business empire runs into thousands of crores. He has only one daughter.

His family has liked you a lot for your personality and looks also. They want you to be their Son-in-Law at any cost. The girl has also liked you. Recently they have sent costly gifts to your parents, about which you were unaware of.

1) Do you think it is unethical for you to marry the girl as you are going to serve in the same state and where there are chances of you working under your future Father-in-Law?

Comment (150 Words)

2) Will you deny this marriage proposal because your father-in-law was a criminal and many cases against him are pending? Comment (100 Words)

3) Critically examine ethical issues involved in this case study. (100 Words)

Ans:

1) This is a case where objectivity of the job and personal relations can be at the conflict. In every job which commands authority and discretionary powers, this situation is bound to arise. The onus of being neutral lies on the person who is in authoritative position. Our founding fathers of nation such as Lal Bahadur Shastri, Jawahar lal Nehru, Sardar Patel, Maulana Azad etc. in spite of being in very authoritative position, are known for their personal integrity and impartiality. I think it would be unfair to deny the marriage proposal just with the apprehension that it may compromise your duty ethics.

2) I am marrying with a person whose father was a criminal and has many cases pending against him. The girl is well educated and down to earth. With education comes a power to differentiate between wrong and right. Since girl is well educated, it can be assumed with a great extent that she is good person also. We cannot blame her for her father's activities. However, I shall talk to her about her father and what she thinks about him. If her thoughts are neutral and unbiased because he is her father, I would like to marry her. If she is not able to come out of her emotions, I would reject the proposal because later in life it will hurt our relation.

3) For me it is the case of conflict of interest. Father of daughter is a criminal and later in life he may ask me to bend on his whims and fancies. It may compromise my job ethics and values. For the girl, it may lead to emotional crisis where she has to choose between her father and husband.

18th July 2014

Q1). As a DM of a home district of serving Chief Minister, you find out that a huge land scam has taken place in which close relatives of the Chief Minister are involved. The scam which you have unearthed has caused lots of financial loss to the state's exchequer. You have been recently married to a daughter of an MLA who is known as staunch political enemy of the CM.

While you are investigating the matter for further proofs, before you make this issue public, the CM comes to know about this. He threatens you with dire consequences if you do not close the file and bury the matter silently. He threatens you with false criminal cases and CBI investigation in case you do not budge. Unfortunately, a case is pending against you regarding misuse of treasury funds, in which you haven't done anything wrong. This case can be reopened and used against you. However, if you stop investigation, he has assured you that you will be given a plum post in the capital.

Identify which course of action is available to you. Examine each action's merits and demerits. Finally, explain which course of action would you follow and why. **(250 Words)**

Ans:

The situation puts on test my integrity and commitment towards public service and my ability to refuse immediate lures. There are two actions available with me in such situation:
(a) accept the orders of CM, hide the case and get rewarded with a plum posting.
(b) Deny the offer.

Option (a):

Merits

CM minister is the administrative head of state. He has the power to transfer me. Obeying his order is my solemn duty. And in this case i will also be rewarded with a plum posting. This will also avoid the unnecessary trouble that may happen to me due to enquiry.

Demerits

Following CM's order amounts to betraying the "public trust". I will join the brigade of other corrupt officers due to dereliction of duty. It will cause huge loss to public exchequers.

Option (b):

Merits

I will uphold the rule of law. Disclosure of information will bring to books a corrupt politician and will help in recovery of money. It will aid in political career of my father-in-law.

Demerits

I will get a punishment posting. There are chances of suspension on account of previous treasury enquiry. CM can alter my ACR that can derail my career.

My decision

I will stick to option (b). In this situation the pressure on me from my in laws can be tremendous as leakage of information will definitely give a political mileage to my father in law. To handle this i will first avoid discussing such information with my wife. There are chances of my staff leaking this information to my father in law. To overcome his pressure, which i should, the official service rules of reporting case will help me in putting up the case.

The danger of getting harassed should not deter me as CM can at max suspend me and in am protected under Article 311of Constitution. Suspension is not a punishment according to service rule so it won't effect my career as i am spotless in treasury case. In any case my disclosure will cost CM his job so he won't be there to effect my career for longer period.

Classification of plum and punishment postings is a classification of corrupt. Civil services requires sacrifice. Civil servant is an upholder of public trust and his job demands that public money is spent in efficient and effective manner so it is my solemn duty to uphold these values. It will also uphold my integrity and stop me from stepping on a slippery slope that can deteriorate my conscience forever.

19th July 2014

Q1). You are working as Junior Engineer in a Tehsil. You have been given responsibility to measure MGNREGA works undertaken by 3 Gram Panchayats. You have authority to give technical sanctions to all MGNREGA works. In one of these Panchayats you notice that your predecessor had wrongly measured many works, and in many cases he had approved works that never existed. One day few elected members of that Panchayat with bundle of job cards come to you to seek 'sanction' for the works done by them. When enquired, they reveal that they were contractors who had completed works under MGNREGA. When you reject their demand, they threaten you and tell you that the previous Junior Engineer was made to quit his job because he didn't listen to them. This is your first job and is very important to sustain your family. There have been precedents in the past that some junior officials were beaten to death in some parts of the Tehsil.

What will you do in this situation? Explain in detail citing rules from MGNREGA Act. (200 Words)

Ans:

I would tell contractor that there is provision of social audit for MGNREGA and in future it is most likely that they would get caught in future. Also the provision of DBT and biometric authentication will reveal all their wrong doings.

Subsequently i will report such incidence to my higher authorities and seek police protection in case my life is at risk. A report of bogus as well as valid Job card shall be separately prepared by me which shall act as a proof for all past irregularities.

My courage and uprightness will deter me from succumbing to their demands. In any case if i comply as directed by contractors, my job would be in peril. Truth can't be hidden for long and it is better to be courageous than to hide facts and face future actions.

21st July 2014

Q1). Recently a peon was appointed in your office (DM office). He is illiterate and mentally not sound. Ever since his appointment he has been more of a 'burden' than any help in the office. He doesn't know any work. Staff in your office feel that their work is disturbed by his behaviour. The peon is always found to be talking either alone or with anyone he encounters. He is not obeying your staff's orders in the office.

He was appointed on sympathy grounds after his father's untimely death. His mother is ill and always bedridden. His income is the only source for his family now. He got the job after lobbying by a group representing his caste. He was appointed by your predecessor after he was pressurized by local MP. Some moves to remove him by your predecessor were met with public protests by a group representing his caste.

You are very strict and disciplined in your office. You are being respected in your district for your integrity and honesty. You come to know about the peon few days after you assume power. You have observed his behaviour and found him to be unfit to continue in his job. The peon has no other relatives except his mother.

Identify your moral and professional responsibilities in this case study and explain how will you deal with the peon. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

This case is a typical moral and Professional ethical dilemma that many professionals and officers face in their day-to-day work life.

Professional ethics in this particular case ask for removal of the peon who is not fit to be in the service. Apart from this he is creating disturbance to others, there by creating impediment to the effective discharge of duties by other staffs in the office. This makes a strong case for his removal from the post.

However, moral side asks for something else. He got his job after untimely death of his father on the basis of sympathy grounds and he is the sole breadwinner for his family. His mother is ill and bed ridden.

Considering all these factors, morality asks for his continuation in his job at the cost of organisational health. More over there is a lot of pressure from his community and a local MP. This makes his removal more difficult than what it would have been.

The practical solution would be giving him the paid medical leave and allowing him to take psychological treatment. This will not only help his family but also help the organisation by improving the morality of the employees.

22nd July 2014

Q1). You are travelling in a government bus to attend a very important job interview. In one hour you should be present at the interview venue. The bus is very congested. Luckily you are seated. From your seat you observe that a middle aged man standing next to a girl is touching and trying to molest her. The girl is silently resisting and trying to move away from him. But the man is continuing his actions. As the bus is congested, nobody is noticing this except you.

1) In this situation, what will you do? Explain. **(150 Words)**

2) If you do not do anything, which values will you be compromising? Explain their importance. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

If I would remain neutral citing my interview as reason then there are arrays of ethics and values which I would be compromising: -

1. Sensitivity: seeing disrespectful acts n remaining inactive clearly indicates insensitiveness on my part towards issues of societies.
2. Respect to women: clearly I would be held responsible for such inimical behaviour for the girl and thus will strengthen the patriarchal setup of the society.
3. Escapist nature: ostrich like burying of head is in no sense a solution for the incident and show self complacency.
4. Inner strength: low inner strength is clearly indicative of low morals n values in such cases for taking no action even after becoming sole witness.

These values are imbibed in a person since her childhood so remaining inimical to such incidents project that I am having no substance in me who could raise voice against such acts at times. This indicates I have no individuality and just a part of the mob.

23rd July 2014

Q1).As a senior officer in the Ministry of Public Works Department you have access to important policy decisions and upcoming big announcements such as road construction projects before they are notified in the public. Your son is a land dealer and realtor. The Ministry is about to announce a mega road project. Once its is announced, the land price in the vicinity would see a steep hike. You have access to maps and know the dimensions of land to be acquired. Your son wants to know the complete details and he is insisting you about this. He wants to buy the land at present rates which is very cheap in and around the soon to be announced project. He is trying to convince you by saying that he would purchase land confidentially and there would be no problem in future for you. You are aware that the Minister has already shared this information with his children who are also into the land business. In fact, the minister has asked you to do the same so that your son also makes huge profits. He has tried to convince you by saying that his and your children are buying land legally and there is no harm in it.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

In this situation, what will you do? Critically examine various conflicts of interests at play in this case study and explain what are your responsibilities as a public servant. (250 Words)

Ans:

Disclosure of information that may lead to undue advantage to a particular group is against the professional code of conduct of executives. This situation involves conflict of interest that are:

- (a) Public interest vs private gains: Bureaucrats are trustees of public interest. They have access to secret information based on the trust that they will not leak it selectively. Disclosing the information to my son would betray public trust for private gains.
- (b) Professional secrecy vs cronyism: Breach of secrecy is a fraud on professional ethics. It will amount to disciplinary action that will have disastrous consequences on both my job and career of my son.
- (c) Professional commitment vs nepotism: Partnering minister in his unethical and corrupt conduct tantamount to being equally culpable in crime. Even if I don't disclose the information to my son, silence makes me a partner in crime.

As a public servant my foremost responsibility is to uphold public trust. My appointment comes with a legal code of conduct and conventional code of ethics. These codes forbid me to disclose the information even if I am assured of safety. Also, it demands me to blow whistle in case of frauds. By acquiescing to minister and my son's argument that the land would be purchased legally, I will act as a fool. In the era of vigilant media and civil society it would be just a matter of time to establish conclusively that information was leaked to the advantage of minister's children and my son.

In the situation my first action would be secure myself from such postings that involve conflict of interest and also advise same for the minister. Citing my son's business I will immediately seek transfer.

I will also mention the conflict of interest of minister in my application. Without directly citing leakage of information by minister I would be able to create enough deterrent for minister's sibling to refrain them from purchasing those lands.

24th July 2014

Q1). Recently you were appointed as Panchayat Secretary. Block Development Officer has called you and other Panchayat Secretaries for a meeting. The meeting is headed by local MLA. In the meeting while taking note of different development activities, he tells everyone to contribute Rs 20,000/- towards building a community hall in nearby town for the benefit of community to which he belongs to. He says that as everyone is taking bribe there is no harm in donating few thousand rupees towards welfare activities.

After the meeting you meet the Block Development Officer and tell him that as you are new to the job you do not have money and moreover it's wrong to give money which will be

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

unaccounted. BDO angrily shouts at you and asks you to not only give Rs 20,000/- by whatever means, you should also give him Rs 5000/- every month as part of 'tradition' that's in practice in his office since past many years. He says that once you learn the skills in your new job, you will start earning more.

How will you react immediately? What course of action you will take later and why? Explain. (250 Words)

Ans:

My immediate response will be to say no to his illegitimate demand. I will try to remind him of the service manual rules that strictly prohibit graft. Since BDO and MLA are asking for unaccounted money, it amounts to graft. By acquiescing, I will be colluding in a corrupt act that amounts to crime and is punishable under Prevention of Corruption Act.

Coercive contributions, specifically directed towards promotion of any particular community are a violation of Fundamental right (Art 27). I will remind them of the legal remedy in the form of writ petition that I can use if they force me to contribute for MLA's community hall.

My service rule demands that on witnessing any graft I should immediately blow whistle by approaching suitable hierarchy. I will report the matter to Sub Divisional Magistrate and District Magistrate of the illegal tax of Rs.5000 imposed by BDO. But before reporting I will talk to other Panchayat secretaries and make them aware of their rights and duties. I will ask them to stop paying unaccounted tax to BDO. I will also seek their support in reporting the matter.

In case the SDM and DM are also a party to graft, I will first file an FIR at police station. This is a necessary measure to ensure security of my life. I will approach service tribunal to expose BDO and file a writ petition against MLA. The situation is testing my integrity, honesty and ability to resist illegitimate pressure. I will not budge and uphold these values.

25th July 2014

You are posted as Superintendent of Police (SP) to a district which has history of communal clashes. You are married to a lady belonging to a particular minority community which has a significant presence in the district. You are cordial with everyone irrespective of their religion and caste. Unfairly you have been accused of having a very close relationship with businessmen and religious heads belonging to a minority community to which your wife belongs. In the past this community was part of communal clashes in the district. As per the stats available, more people from this minority community have died in the past compared to the majority community in the clashes between them.

The media in the district, electronic and print, which is owned by a person affiliated to a large organisation representing the majority religious community, is writing series of articles accusing you of favouritism, nepotism and indifference to crimes committed by criminals belonging to the minority community. Some articles have also criticised you saying that

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

your wife is influencing your decisions in some sensitive investigations. Some splinter organisations representing the majority community have held protests against you too.

- 1) In this situation, how will you react? Explain in detail why you will react in a particular way. **(200 Words)**
- 2) Examine which qualities of SP would be put into test in the above case study. **(100 Words)**

Ans:

Here, pressure tactics as usual are used by special interest groups to disturb the peaceful environment and spread communalism and violence. So, strict and tactful action is needed to stop it while making sure that no communal disturbance erupts in the process.

Marrying in other community is allowed in constitution of India and as such is not a crime. So, I'll not pay head to such allegations regarding their false allegations, but will make sure that such allegations don't result in social unrest.

Regarding the criminal elements that perpetuate the communal disturbance will be investigated and punished as per the due process of law. No, discrimination will be done by me towards a particular community in this aspect.

Media's role is enormous in law and order and it has brought spontaneity, locality up-to homes, and instantaneous nature of information. Thus, media should be held accountable and should be objective, clear and unbiased. So, for stopping the false allegations I'll make sure that corrects facts, and figures regarding communal violence and actions taken against criminals are shown through media to the public. If media owner is spreading false rumors, official inquiry will be set up against him and action taken according to the provisions specified in law.

As the SP of district, my primary responsibility is to maintain law and order, withhold public image and trust, and make sure that public remains safe and peace prevails. To ensure these, above steps are necessary.

- 2) - Qualities tested in above case are -
 - (a) Impartiality – Towards majority and minority community.
 - (b) Patience – Not to make hasty and biased decisions and knee-jerk reactions to the allegations made to ensure that it doesn't lead to spontaneous violence.
 - (c) Ability to withstand pressure – SP will have to keep his calm and composure even in extreme stress situations.
 - (d) Saving public image of SP and his office's ability to maintain public order thus withholding public trust and order.
 - (e) Saving dignity of women – By ensuring that proper information is disseminated and false allegations against my wife are proved to be false in public.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

26th July 2014

Your husband is watching a news report on rape along with your 8 year old daughter. The report is airing graphic pictures of rape and murder scenes. Your father-in-law who is also watching the report comments that your daughter is not safe on the streets and she should be taught how to dress from now itself so that she would be safe when she grows up. Your husband concurs. In the same hall you are helping your son with his home work while listening to all the conversations happening in the hall. In between your son, who is 12 year old, keeps asking you about what's rape, who commits it and why every news channel is talking about only this issue etc. You are focusing only on his home work and not reacting to anything.

1) Identify the various issues in the case study and give your opinion on them. **(250 Words)**

Ans:

Rape is heinous crime against society that violates the integrity of a woman. Various issues involved in this situation are:

- (a) Media sensationalising tendency and a complete disregard towards its impact on society.
- (b) Patriarchal mindset reflected by grandfathers' argument linking dress as cause of rape.
- (c) Curiosity and lack of sex education among children.

Parents' basic duty is to protect children from situations that cast deleterious impact on their mental health. I will switch off or change the channel that shows the victim in wasted state. I will launch a complaint against TV channels in BCCCI (Broadcasting Content Complaint Council of India) for violation of SC guidelines so that such graphics are not repeated.

Clothing is an individual choice and depends on socio- economic and climatic circumstances. Blaming it as a cause of rape is a pervert mind set. Instead of teaching how to wear i will teach my children how to live decently. Everybody has a choice to dress and even if he/she dresses irresponsibly others have no right to intrude.

Sex education among children and adolescent is the need of hour. I, together with my husband will teach about basic mannerism towards other sex to my children. This will help them defend themselves in society and also to check such misbehaviour among their friends. This will help them to grow up as a responsible citizen.

27th July 2014

A man convicted for rape and murder of two 15 year old girls has been awarded death sentence by the court. His sentence is due in 3 days. You are the in charge of the jail and have been assigned to supervise his death sentence. The convict becomes seriously ill two days before he is about to be hanged. Preliminary medical tests reveal that he has blood cancer. Your colleagues advise you that as he is about to be executed, the matter should be

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

kept as secret and the convict should be kept in his cell. Even jail doctors advise you the same. They also tell you that this convict deserved such a death for his crime.

What will you do in this situation? Explain why. (200 Words)

Ans:

In this situation, I will allow the hanging to take place as planned. This is because:

a) Rape and murder of minors is indeed heinous. As court has asked for death sentence to be given and I'm in charge for his death's supervision, I will allow law to take its course despite any new findings like illness etc.

b) Cancer being deadly disease will also ultimately result in his death, albeit more painful. There is no point now in giving him chemotherapy and helping him recover, and then giving him death sentence. Also process may take months or years, and at greatest cost to the ex-chequer for a man who had committed dreadful crime and had been adjudged by court of the land to be hanged.

Therefore, I will go ahead with hanging schedule of the rapist by concurring with jail doctors and colleagues. This would be a collective decision and for the good of the man as well as sending strong message to society.

Ans2: A contrarian View

Convict has done heinous crime i.e. rape and murder of minor girls for which he has been already awarded death sentence.

Reasons for giving death sentence -

a) For punishing him for his brutal act.

b) For sending a signal to society, so that death sentence acts as a deterrent for future such crimes.

Murdering is a crime, but in this case death is sentenced by law and approved by society, so it is the social sanction that makes even a heinous crime of murdering someone as approved. same, is the case in wars when soldiers murder enemies to defend country.

So, our actions are judged by the values and humanity that society thinks as sacred in specific contexts. Some values are freedom, piety, basic human rights, kindness etc.

In this case, I've 2 options -

a) I let the inmate suffer for 2 days and later supervise his death sentence after that.

b) I send inmate to doctor and give him treatment as devised in law, and seek the proper legal course later.

In the above two ways, I will choose 2nd way. My logic is again the same that I've to preserve the basic human rights for which this guy was given the death sentence. His act was wrong, but its the badness that we want to eliminate from society.

If we our self become inhuman, then we are no different than the inmate, who lost all moral values and did such heinous crime. Choosing first option is like we take law in our own hand and give him a second punishment to suffer from cancer, while we enjoy and

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

complacency ourselves as vindicator of justice. We have to follow the rules and duties given to us and should never try to take law in hand. So, I'll go with the option 2nd.

29th July 2014: No Question Uploaded by Insights

30th July 2014

As a DM, you are doing your best to demolish all illegal encroachments in the district headquarters. This has brought you a good name. At the heart of the city, there is an immediate need of widening a road where lately lots of accidents have taken place because of huge vehicle traffic. In the middle of this road there is a temple which is causing lots of traffic problems thanks to large number of devotees who visit it daily. Investigation reveals that the temple is constructed illegally on government property. If congestion is to be eased on the road, the temple must be demolished. You send a notice to temple management. They sensationalize the issue through media by twisting facts. They also politicize the issue. They have also tried to incite communal feelings of devotees. You know that the temple management is getting huge income from the temple and this is one of the reasons why there is stiff opposition for its demolition. You also get frequent calls from prominent politicians requesting you not to go ahead with its demolition. Your family members, who are god-fearing, are also against your decision.

In this situation, what will you do? Explain the consequences and how will you deal with them. (250 Words)

Ans:

Being the DM it is my duty to maintain peace and integrity in my district and to prevent illegal encroachments

The consequences if i go for demolition:

Communal unrest, respective religious group may pressurise you and your family, threaten you with the acts of god (for example: attack)

political unrest: your seniors will pressurise you to not carry out demolition with the threat of de-promoting, transfer etc. family members will be annoyed

If not demolished:

- 1).temple management will keep on making money out of people's religious belief.
- 2).Accidents will keep on taking place and pple will keep suffering.
- 3).will promote other illegal encroachments in the name of religion.

Action to be taken:

will disclose the report reflecting the monetary gain of temple management . This will nullify their claim to some extent. Both media and politicians will be informed of the problems being faced by people and the increasing no. of accidents with this view, i will propose following two actions,

1. The road will be widened by removing the nearby construction and paying the respective compensation and ensure the rehabilitation of those who are displaced and getting the nod

from my seniors in this regard.

2. Divert the road in that region and the temple management be asked to contribute in the road construction.

31st July 2014

Recently there was a communal clash between communities X and Y in one of the villages under your jurisdiction. It was so severe that, all the people belonging to minority community X, fled from their village. Later they were given shelter in nearby temporary camp. The camp lacked all basic amenities. After few days, law and order was restored in the village. The majority community Y is unwilling to welcome back even a single person from the minority community. Whereas, the minority community do not want to return for the fear of reprisals. People from both the communities were killed and raped during the clashes. As a DM of the district it's your responsibility to maintain law and order in your jurisdiction. The people in camp are demanding rehabilitation in a new place. They are seeking government help in building new homes, jobs for one member from each of their families and round the clock police protection.

The CM has directed you to find a solution to the impasse. He has specifically told you that rehabilitation is not an option when the properties of the minority community are intact in their village. He is in favour of sending them back to their village.

In this situation what will you do? Explain. (200 Words)

Ans:

Post roit relief and rehabilitation measure are not only moral imperatives and basic duty of a failed administration but it also provide opportunity to contemplate issues leading to clashes and to provide innovative solutions to prevent future communal conflagrations. A surgical introspection of the crises reveals:

(a) Widespread intolerance and unaccomodative behaviour of both communities, though standing on unequal platforms.

(b) Three demands of minorities: rehabilitation to new place, compensatory employment and police protection.

I will first address the second issue of minorities demand as it requires immediate solution. Rehabilitation to a new place is subjective depending on the availability of space and political directions. It also encourages majorities to fume clashes to drive out minorities from their areas. Since CM has declined to rehabilitate the persons to new place i will first identify the segment that can be rehabilitated under IAY.

After passing on benefits to them to built new home the remaining will be pursued to return to their homes on the assurance of 24x7 police security. For this i will establish a police station in the village to check any untoward incident. All culprits irrespective of their community shall be arrested and the law will take it due course.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

All effected peoples who have lost their livelihood irrespective of their community will be encouraged to register under various skill training initiatives. Till then MGNREGA will be used to insure livelihood security.

A loathsome vice in the form of communal hatred and intolerance has entered the society. This needs a long term solution. I will rope in the help of older members of both communities by forming a peace committee to enhance community participation. Different channels of participation like gram sabha, management of common property resource etc will be encouraged. Illiteracy is the breeding ground of intolerance. I will ensure that the village schools are run properly as per SSA and RTE guidelines. Encouraging sporting activities will also develop a lifelong friendship among both communities.

1st Aug 2014

You are the CEO of Zilla Panchayat. A Gram Panchayat Secretary has been assaulted by Gram Panchayat member. The member is an influential figure in the Tehsil and is very close to the local MLA. The Panchayat Secretary is severely injured and is hospitalised. He was assaulted after being caught red handed while taking bribe from a poor woman in the office. The member has the support of villagers and MLA. All these incidences have been brought to your notice by the Block Development Officer.

What will you do in this situation? (200 Words)

Ans:

In this situation, ethical dilemma arises as to take action against whom:

- a) Panchayat member who had ruthlessly beaten Panchayat Secretary due to latter accepting bribe
- b) Panchayat Secretary who had indulged in corruption

Here it is important to note the following:

1) Panchayat Secretary was unethical in firstly accepting/demanding bribe.

2) However, this should not allow any person to take law in his own hands. Here, panchayat member with almost mob support (villagers back him, though they themselves did not assault) has taken law in his hands, which is also unethical. He could have taken help of law- contacted Vigilance department and laid a trap to catch him red-handed again, or lodged FIR in police station.

Therefore, I will take the following steps:

a) First I will conduct an enquiry myself with help of other Parishad members into incident, as BDO has just informed me.

b) If I find that the incident is true and Panchayat Secretary is in hospital, I'll extend all treatment support to him. Also, I'll talk to the poor woman and tell her to lodge FIR against Secretary if he demanded bribe. Law will take its course here.

c) Also, I'll ask Police to investigate into Panchayat Member's actions and proceed accordingly with relevant sections of law he has violated.

In this way, I will be able to solve the issue in unbiased way and uphold my values of non-partisanship, empathy, integrity and going by law.

2nd Aug 2014

Your friend is staying with you and is preparing for the civil services exam along with you. He is from a very poor family. You know him since childhood. You have accommodated him for free of cost in your room. He is not paying for anything. Earlier he used to work hard, but lately he is spending his time mostly watching movies or talking to friends on the phone. There is another friend who wants to move in to your room. He is willing to pay half the rent. He will also arrange his own food.

Though you have made efforts to make your friend realize his mistakes, he still continues to spend time on unproductive activities. He has never disturbed you directly though. Recently the rent was increased. Now it is a burden for you to pay all the rent and food charges of your friend.

What will you do? Explain why. (200 Words)

Ans:

Assumption- I belong to a lower middle class and my parents are spending their hard earned money to give me a golden opportunity to pursue my dream of becoming IAS officer.

Non-targeted and wasteful subsidies has not done well for governments and I am just a student belonging to lower middle class. I will sit with my friend and confront him with the situation about his disturbing activities which are detrimental to his career as well as peaceful environment of room (vital for effective study).

I shall ask him to mend his ways and perhaps give me time of a couple of months. I believe he will improve and work hard; if not, then he does not deserve this opportunity which is dream of many more hardworking and serious candidates. I shall go ahead and change my room-mate.

4th August 2014 No question uploaded by IOI

5th August 2014

You are working as an Executive Engineer in the Panchayat Raj division. An RTI activist has filed an application seeking information regarding tender process to project completion of all road projects that you have supervised and allotted since you assumed office. In one of the road projects, under pressure from an influential politician (he had threatened you with life), you had mismanaged the tender allotment process and allotted works to the politician's brother who is a contractor. The project was worth Rs 20 crores. The road constructed was substandard.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

In this situation, what are your moral obligations and what course of action will you take? Explain. (250 Words)

Ans:

Being an executive my moral obligation is to uphold the public trust reposed on me by conducting the public affairs with utmost transparency and reduce losses to public exchequers. Under undue pressure, I have compromised my integrity, public trust and conducted my office in unfair manner.

My moral obligations under this situation are:

- (a) Restore public trust that I have compromised by colluding with corrupts.
- (b) Disclose public information under RTI with utmost sincerity and transparency.
- (c) Correct the aberration in my ethical standards.
- (d) Secure the department from such political pressures by bringing my own case to light.

"A human is bound to make mistake but our ability to correct those mistakes defines the greatness of our character". RTI provides me with the opportunity to correct my previous mistake. In this situation I will disclose all the information without hiding my role in the corruption that had occurred.

Though my action may have serious repercussion on my job yet, the opportunity provided by RTI should be secured to correct my ethical compass. Disclosure of information along with the political pressure under which I succumbed will bring to fore the political intrusions in executive field.

I should stay confident of the judicial process that follows as I have not secured any personal benefits in the act. The delinquency and unfairness was only to secure my life (a right recognised both by constitution and CrPC).

Yet, I should be ready to undergo any punishment that court may pronounce as I failed to utilise the remedies like lodging a FIR and informing my seniors and have acquiesced in the act. This will be my penitence.

6th August 2014

You are working as Home Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs. During your tenure, you have acted toughly against anti-national elements including many banned terrorist organisations. While on a private trip, you have been abducted by terrorists belonging to a banned terrorist group. They have demanded the release of all the terrorists jailed in different parts of the country in exchange for your safe release, failing which you will be killed. They are asking you to record a video message for the government appealing them to release all the prisoners for your own safe release. They have given an ultimatum of one week for the government to respond, failing which your video message would be sent as last resort for the government to act.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

- 1) Examine the ethical issues involved in the above case study. **(50 Words)**
- 2) Will you record a video statement as demanded by them to influence the government? Explain why. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

- 1) The ethical issues involved in the situation are:
 - (a) Primacy of my personal life and security.
 - (b) Primacy of national security.
 - (c) Value assigned to self life and to those who sacrificed their lives while fighting an arresting those jailed terrorist.

The values are competing and creating an ethical dilemma where i have to choose between my own life and the innocent lives of those that will stand at peril by terrorist activities of released terrorist. There is another dilemma i.e. the value i assign to my life and the respect i assign to martyrs who lost their life while arresting terrorist.

- 2) Arrested by terrorist i am in extreme pressure and mental agony. My life is not only precious to me but to my family and others who are dependent on me. My services are also valuable to my nation. Yet, i will decline to record message to secure my release because:

- (a) Such exchanges with terrorist set a stage where they feel that by kidnapping and bargaining a nation can be brought down on knees. Once accepted as rule that no exchange of terrorist will happen, chances of kidnapping will be greatly reduced. USA for instance follows such policy and hence political kidnapping are minimal there.

- (b) My release will not only tarnish the priceless sacrifice of our martyrs but will also threaten many innocent lives. Saving a life while sacrificing many others is neither logical nor justified.

- (c) It will undermine the capacity of my defence forces, one that i served, strengthened and helped to tackle any threat.

I will believe in the capacity of my force to secure my release. Though it sounds like a cliché, yet i will stand by my conviction that i followed while serving home department and be ready to sacrifice my life if the situation goes wrong.

7th July 2014

You are serving as Superintendent of Police (SP) in a district notorious for kidnapping cases. In one such kidnapping case, ten school girls have been kidnapped and hidden in an unknown place. In previous cases, where one or two girls were kidnapped, they were sold

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

to prostitution racket in a foreign country. Your team, under your guidance tracks the kingpin of these kidnappings and arrests him. During routine interrogation, the arrested kingpin do not reveal any location names nor he talks about anything related to kidnappings. Your sources clearly tell you that he is the one behind all kidnappings. Even after using all legal methods to get information from him, your efforts have not yielded any result. Your friend, who is an SP in another district suggests you to torture the kingpin to get information. You are aware of the situation that the girls might be sold and trafficked to a foreign country if you further delay investigation.

1).What will you do in such a situation? Is it ethical to torture a person to save other innocent lives? Critically comment. (200 Words)

Ans:

Teleological theory suggests the action be judged upon the consequences of the action. Here ,in this case i will be forced to torture the person as there is likelihood that he knows something according to my sources.

Deontological theory, suggests the actions be judged upon the duties being performed or not and being the superintendent of police, law and order in the district is my supreme duty in conformity with respect to the liberty and human rights of other persons.

Also the utilitarian principle "greatest good for greatest number "conforms with the situation as the innocent lives are at stake against the life of the accused (kingpin)

In all the three cases i am justified for taking the action (torture) against the kingpin for getting more information from him. There is possibility that the kingpin shares either the information about the address of abducted girls or he knows about the conspirator who has done or can do such thing.

While the torture can be mental ,emotional and finally physical, there is a possibility that the investigation is taken forward (as legal avenues are not helping).In the course of action (torture) i am required to shackle the hedonistic principle or equilibrium position of the kingpin to gather the information. So it is ethical to torture a person for the greater good of the society.

The future course of the action can only be determined after shackling the equilibrium position as there is very little time for investigation of the abduction.

8th August 2014 - 27th August 2014 : No Question uploaded by IOI

28th Aug 2014

Q1) What teachings of Lord Buddha are most relevant today and why? Critically examine. (200 Words)

Reference

Reference – 2

Ans:

Teachings of Lord Buddha, though almost 3000 years old, can still act as beacon to guide this chaotic world to achieve its real purpose. Among multiple teachings mentioned in Sutta Pitaka, few are:

(a) World is transient and soul less in which sorrow is intrinsic to human. To address this Buddha proposed the path of moderation: Moderation prevents the capture of human soul by greed and jealousy that has permeated this materialistic and capitalistic world. This way, humanity is retained and exploitation is avoided.

(b) Buddha considered social world as the creation of human: Various malpractices causing discrimination and marginalisation like for eg. untouchability, gender discrimination, status of women, her drudgery are all creation of humans and need solution from humans only. Neither of the godly scriptures nor divine intervention are going to solve it.

(c) Buddha highlighted individual agency and righteous actions as mean to nirvana: Individual agency serves as an agent of change. From Gandhi to Mother Teresa, individuals have proven that determination rather than majority is the key to bring change in society. Righteous action is the manifestation of ethics. In India the incidence of rising corruption and degradation of moral character makes righteous action immensely important.

Besides them Astangika Marg as proposed by Buddha can shown the right way to live a contained life full of happiness.

Q2) You are the principal of a girls' residential high school. One day a girl from an hostel complains that her warden, a lady who is also her class teacher, had beaten her last night for falling asleep early. It is a rule in the hostel that every student should study till 10 pm. The girl has suffered minor injury on her head because of the beating. The girl is requesting you to allow her to go home for treatment. You are aware that if her parents comes to know about this incident, things might turn ugly and also the issue could be sensationalised by the media, which in turn would affect the reputation of your school.

In this situation, what will you do and why? Explain. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

Corporal punishment is banned under RTE. Thus while the student has broken the law by not studying and sleeping early the warden too has exceeded her authority. In this situation the demand to go home can also bring unusual trouble to my hostel so i will take following actions:

(a) First i will call the hostel doctor to treat the injured girl. I will also talk to her to placate her and help her come out of that shock. After she is comfortable i will try to know the reason of her early nap. If it is due to some illness i will arrange the necessary treatment.

(b) Allowing girl to travel to her home in injured state may be hazardous for her as she may collapse midway. So i will inform her parents.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

(c) As the warden has broken law i will immediately suspend her and setup an inquiry to know the truth. Police shall also be informed as the RTE law demands me to do so.

With these actions in place well before the parents of girl child arrive and through my motherly treatment of the girl i can ensure and convince the parents of the girl to avoid any media reporting as requisite actions have already been taken by me.

I will try to convince and assure the parents that any hype can affect the studies of other girls in the hostel. With these measures i am convinced that i will be able to control the situation with justice done to both the girl student and the warden.

29th August 2014: No question uploaded by IOI

30th August 2014

Q1) Looking at the ongoing conflicts around the world, which world leader of the past would you have liked to see him/her today to solve these conflicts and why? Comment (200 Words)

Ans:

All the conflicts around the world that we see are rooted in greed and hunger for more power. Greed for annexing or asserting hegemony over resource rich areas, wars in the name of religion or as subtle as creating economic dominance or refusing to take responsibility for the harm done to environment.

However, to tackle the ills of contemporary world we need a leader who can create more leaders at an individual level more than one skilled in negotiating diplomatically at global level.

A leader who can inspire people to be tolerant, generous, compassionate, kind and humane. Then only can we expect to strike at the roots of all evil and that is greed & intolerance. A society which considers all people as one big family is the one which is the antidote to today's conflicts.

I would like to see Mother Teresa as the leader to solve the problems of contemporary world. We don't need leaders who pursue war to attain peace but leaders who pursue peace to attain peace.

Leader like Mother Teresa who considered everyone as one and equal and when people do the same they will not kill rather seek humane ways to tackle the conflicts grappling the world. We need leaders who serve humanity selflessly rather than those who perpetuate conflicts for their selfishness.

Q2) You are a civil services aspirant. One day in a narrow colony of the city where you stay, you observe that a woman is manually cleaning human excreta. She is wearing uniform given by the local municipality.

What will you do in this situation and what should be done by you ideally? Explain why. (200 Words)

Reference

Ans:

A dilemma of what i should do and what ideally should be done happens only when moral moorings are too weak. There is clear law, Manual scavenging(Relief and Rehabilitation) Act that will guide my action.

The dilemma that i will face is my involvement in a just cause may utilise my precious time. My course of action will be:

- (a) I will first record her work in my mobile which will act as a potent evidence.
- (b) I will talk to her to know whether she is provided with required equipments to help her job and whether she knows about the right granted to her in latest law.
- (c) I will make a call to the municipal office to ascertain the reason of such delinquency and will lodge a complaint.
- (d) I will also lodge a complaint in grievance redressal portal of municipal body.
- (e) A copy of picture and the video i recorded will be mailed to the municipal commissioner seeking his intervention.

Tolerating injustice in the name of seeking bigger goal leaves an indelible mark on our moral righteousness. It is a slippery slope that degrades the ethical parameters of personal living. So, I follow the advice of Mahatma Gandhi that not only goal but also the path should be righteous, a cocktail of teleological and deontological approach but with a better outcome.

31st Aug 2014

Q1) What do you understand by ethics of war? Identify and critically comment on different ethical dimensions that a war between two or more nations or a war between a nation and a terrorist group gives rise to. **(250 Words)**

Reference - 1

Reference - 2

Ans:

War is defined as use of armed force by two or more sides against each other. Ethics of war can be referred to as revolving around the following concepts:

The reason for initiating the war: Is it just or unjust?

The method of conducting the war: Is it conducted as per relatively moral and just means and whether the amount of force used is proportional to the reason?

Other methods of resolving the conflict: All the methods should be extinguished before even contemplation of armed conflict

There are many dimensions of ethics which are affected whenever a war between nations or nation and a terrorist group break out. The first and foremost is the reason of the war, the cause is always subjective to the point of view for e.g. The 1956 war between Egypt and

Israel, British and French due to nationalization of Suez Canal can be viewed from 2 dimensions.

Egypt held its natural right of Sovereignty over the canal and the need to use for the larger public good, while the British would justify the war on the basis that the investment were made by them and at least till the investment is recovered the canal should be under their supervision.

Other dimension getting affected are harming the innocent civilians for no fault of theirs, Most of the wars are part of power play between groups and realist even contend that power is the only guiding force in the international arena. Many a times a terrorist group may wage a war only to attain or correct the historical injustice meted out to them thus in such a scenario it is not easy to determine who owns the moral high ground

Q2) You are a boss of a small private organisation. You are about to meet important clients who will be visiting your office shortly. But you get a call from your wife that your son who is suffering from autism is performing dance in his school, which is first for you both and a very happy occasion. The meeting which was scheduled can not be postponed, moreover if the meeting is successful, your company benefits enormously in terms of new contracts. As you deem son's performance is more important than the business deal, you ask your personal assistant to call the clients and tell them that you are unwell and the meeting can be held tomorrow.

Identify different personal and professional ethical issues present and examine if any values have been compromised in the above case study? **(200 Words)**

Ans:

Let us examine the situations at two levels:

1) Ethics in personal relation :: Playing the father role in the present social construct to the best of my abilities is both my ethical and social obligation. However it will compromise both my relations (as a husband and as a father) if I would not be present in an important occasion like this (considering that my son has autism dancing is difficult as well as challenging for him).

2) Ethics in professional relation :: Being the boss it is expected of me to work for the best interest of the company so that all those who have shown confidence in me (by making me the boss) are not left high and dry due to my personal commitments (unless it is an extreme emergency). Losing the deal would mean losing a big contract which would have benefitted all the employees.

Hence at both the levels I face a morally conflicting situation.

Any action is morally right or wrong based on three primary factors, the object, the circumstances and the purpose. The action I took in this case (lying to get out of the meeting) even though the purpose is right but the object is morally wrong.

Lying (as a morally wrong activity) cannot be justified by a right purpose (here I am compromising on values). If I have to really get out of the situation then telling the truth (and asking to reschedule it as his convenience) would have been a more ethical action

1st Sept 2014

Q1). What do you understand by ethics in public administration? Why is it important? Explain. (200 Words)

Ans:

Ethics is a system based on morals. In public administration, ethics focuses on how the public administrators should questions and reflect in order to be able to act responsibly, honour public trust and not violate it.

An administrator should follow the law and rules that are framed to govern and guide various categories of policies and decisions. They could be summarized as following maxims:

- 1) Maxims of responsibility & accountability- guides him to hold himself morally responsible for his actions & for the use of his discretion while making decisions.
- 2) Maxims of work commitment - leads him to perform his work with involvement, intelligence & dexterity.
- 3) Maxims of excellence - direct him to ensure the highest standards of quality in administrative decisions.
- 4) Maxims of fusion -channelize him to rationally bring about a fusion of individual, organisational & social goals to help evolve unison of ideals and imbibe in his behaviour a commitment to such a fusion.
- 5) Maxims of responsiveness and resilience - directs him to respond effectively to the demands & challenges from the external as well as internal environment.
- 6) Maxims of utilitarianism - direct him to make policies in such a way so that these lead to the greatest good (happiness, benefits) of the greatest number
- 7) Maxims of compassion - channelize him to demonstrate compassion for the poor, the disabled & the weak without violating any laws.
- 8) Maxims of national interest & justice - reminds him that the impact of his actions would be on his nation's strength and prestige.... direct him to show respect to the principles of equality, equity, fairness, impartiality & objectivity.
- 9) Maxims of transparency & integrity - help the ppl to understand the reason behind any decision... also direct him to undertake an administrative action on the basis of honesty & not use his power, position and discretion to serve his personal interest and the illegitimate action of other individuals or groups.

Q2) Your friend who is travelling with you in a train gives ten rupees to an eight year old girl who is begging for money. An elderly co-passenger comments that it is unethical to give money like that and it would make these children lazy forever. Another co-passenger, a middle aged lady sympathises with the girl and tells the elderly man that the girl must be an orphan thus needs money for sustenance and she goes on to appreciate your friend for giving the girl money.

Whom will you support in this situation? Explain why. **(200 Words)**

Ans:

I'll support elderly man because he's right. Child begging is so dominant because people sympathize with them and donate money. It affects their studies, health and future.

Also -

- (a) Begging is a civil offence according to Indian law.
- (b) Big crime rackets run behind these child beggars

Solution -

- (a) RTE (right to education provides free and compulsory education as fundamental right to every child up to age of 14)
- (b) Mid-Day Meal program provides them food in schools.
- (c) Anganbadi scheme takes care of small children
- (d) Poor parents can get state support for their survival and PDS grains to feed and survive.

Thus, it is not required, neither necessary for children to beg and those who support begging by providing money are equally breaking the law as beggars.

2nd Sept 2014

Q1) Effective utilization of public funds is critical to meeting development goals. Critically examine the reasons behind under-utilisation and misutilisation of public funds and their implications. Also suggest with examples how public funds can be effectively utilised. (250 Words)

Reference - 1

Reference - 2

Reference - 3

Ans:

Reasons for Under Utilization:

Budgetary allocations-March rush- not properly utilized

Lack of awareness/reluctance on the part of the bureaucrats, though provisions existing

Divesting of funds from certain departments to other.
Following result based approach, neglecting spill-over effects of funding eg: education, health.

Misutilization: Funds like MPLADS are not properly spent rather used in the next elections for vote-buying

Not following transparent mechanisms like auctioning in awarding tenders

India's disinvestment- not going in the direction of capital asset creation, but addressing fiscal deficit due to subsidy burden. India's policy of buy back- Eg: LIC buying equity of other PSUs- it's like killing the goose that gives golden eggs

Government giving bail out to certain loss-making PSUs

Implications: Unearthing of lot of scams affects people's faith in democracy and their tax compliance- because they feel cheated. Increase of black money. India lags in many human development indicators.

Effective usage suggestions:

- 1) Transparency
- 2) Bringing awareness among people to use RTI mechanism effectively
- 3) Strengthening ombudsman systems like Lokpal, Lokayukta.
- 4) Curbing political interference
- 5) Audit by independent authorities and CAG to audit those corporate bodies which take substantial amount for projects from Govt.,
- 6) Curbing lobbying activities
- 7) Addressing the issues of red-tapism, nepotism,
- 8) Better usage of technology and e-governance
- 9) Target driven approach to bureaucrats in spending and obtaining results
- 10) Proper implementation of tribal sub-plan so that funds are not divested.

Q2) Write a note on the ethics of utilisation of public funds. (200 Words)

Reference

Ans:

Ethics of utilisation of public fund emanates from two doctrines

- (a) Doctrine of Public trust.
- (b) Doctrine of Appropriateness.

Public trust doctrine lays responsibility on public servants to expend judiciously so that the public is served and public goals are achieved. It establishes that the money belong to citizen and is given to public officers due to the trust reposed in them.

Appropriateness doctrine emphasises that the way money is spent should bring equity, efficiency and economy. Public officers should apply their acumen and wit in spending.

Apart from that our DPSP brings two more ethical concerns in utilisation of Public funds these are:

- (a) To develop an economic system that does not result in concentration of wealth.
- (b) To utilise funds in a manner that maximises common good (utilitarianism).

Q3) Your father is persuading your sister to study medicine after her 12th Class results. Your sister wants to study engineering in a famous college. Because of her good ranks in entrance exams she can get admission for both engineering and medicine in top colleges. Your father tells her that he has invested lots of money and time for her education, moreover he and his wife are getting old and are tired of frequent bouts of illness. He tells her that if she becomes doctor she can look after him and your mother when they get old. Your sister, despite your father's persuasion, decides to go for engineering course. Your father is shocked by her decision and has fallen sick, but your sister doesn't want to change her decision.

1. In the above case study, was your father right in persuading your sister against her will? Substantiate. (150 Words)
2. Do you support your sister's decision? Explain why. (150 Words)

Ans:

My father was absolutely right in persuading my sister against her will.

Because -

- (a) He's father and thus responsible for his children's future.
- (b) He can have genuine expectations from his children, as he has surely invested his whole life and money in raising us.

But, he was wrong in

- (a) Imposing his will on his children.
- (b) Having expectation that his children will definitely follow his planned approach.

He should have worked as a facilitator, in children's future planning rather than imposing his own will. Also, he should have planned his own future rather than depending on children's.

Yes, I support my sister's decision

because -

- (a) It's her life to choose what she want in life.
- (b) Even if she agrees with father, and joins medical, later she may not be able to cope up with it due to her aptitude towards engineering and may get depressed.

But, she also has a moral responsibility to take care of her parents. So, instead of defying father she should have opted for persuasion.

Now, in present situation she can rectify her mistake by taking care of fathers illness and showing him that she loves her, and despite her joining medical or engineering, her love for father won't reduce a pinch.

3rd Sept 2014

Q1) Which values do you think should constitute moral norms and values of governance? Explain them. (200 Words)

Reference (Page No. 7)

Ans:

Governance is the most basic function of government. But this governance should be practiced in accordance with certain parameters. Moral norms and values provide the guiding principles. Following five moral values are most important for good governance :

- (a) Integrity: This is the cornerstone of public life.
- (b) Honesty: It brings rule based system and avoids injustice.
- (c) Transparency: This brings efficiency and minimizes corruption.
- (d) Accountability: The concerned authorities should understand the importance of their work and take full responsibility for its execution.
- (e) Emotional Intelligence: Public service demands an understanding of people of various walks of life, an ability to be associated with their problems and an ability to practice restraint and calibrated behaviour even in most demanding situations. All these require a high emotional intelligence on part of public servant.

Q2) A multi-storey building which was illegally constructed collapses and kills fifty innocent workers – including women and children. These workers were poor migrants from far away villages. The building was allowed to construct only three storeys, but the builder has violated the rules and raised four more storeys. The government immediately announces cash relief to aggrieved families. The builder is arrested and put under court trial.

1. On whom does the ultimate blame for the death of fifty innocent lives rest – government or builder? Explain why. (200 Words)
2. Is it morally correct to give cash relief to the diseased families in this case? Substantiate why. (150 Words)

Ans:

Good Governance is formed on the basic tenets of Accountability, transparency, integrity, effective regulator and facilitator .Lack of vigilance as a regulator and absence of accountability breeds corruption which is detrimental to the development of a nation.

Prima facie, the case reflects gross negligence and deviance from the established norms by the builder in constructing two more storeys which led to loss of fifty innocent lives .The builder should be made accountable for the loss of lives and should be booked under law which holds true under the principles of due process of law.

Moreover, the case should not limit itself to just punishing the builder, the bigger question here is lack of effective vigilance and regulation on the side of Government. A thorough inquiry should be carried out to find out the government personnel who were acting as the partner in crime by way of construction permits, the local authorities should also be questioned in this matter.

District administration should take a lesson from this incident and must take effective measures to prevent reoccurrence of any such incident in future.

- A) Regulatory body comprising of Block development officers, local representatives, resident welfare association members can be comprised to keep a check on any deviation from rules. Use of e-governance methods can also act as medium of effective regulation.
- B) Cash compensation to the bereaved families has been a norm from the side of government as a relief to the families who lose their members in any untoward incident. Though no amount of money can bring back the lost life, monetary compensation does bring some relief to the poor and downtrodden who face the double tragedy of loss of a family member as well as bread earner of the family.

The workers were poor migrants who left their places in search of work and Government should always fill the vacuum when the last resort fails but in addition to compensation Government should ensure livelihood security to these people under any such existing government scheme.

Speedy justice and punishing the builder for placing innocent lives in danger just for the sake of added profits would hold more value than just compensation and will also send a strong message to the other builders.

5th Sept 2014

Q1) Critically examine the key issues and constraints in the implementation of Right to Information Act. (250 Words)

Reference

Ans:

RTI key issues:

- people still are not ready to make effective use out of RTI because of unawareness and illiteracy.
- bureaucratic lethargy still not gone. RTI commissioners are expressing inability once their orders are not being carried out.
- many issues are still out of purview of RTI.
- penal systems for not implementing are not well established.
- "official secrets act" which is a colonial product is still problematic.
- killing and torture of RTI activists.

Suggestions:

- rational revision of exemptions and Official secrets act.
- wide spread advertisement and education into society.
- strengthening penal procedures for non implementation of act.
- encouragement of periodic open declaration of public information by public authorities. This will reduce the burden.
- protection measures towards safety of RTI activists.

Q2) At all time, a public servant's priority should be serving his nation and its citizens, not the family. Do you agree with this view? Substantiate (200 Words)

Ans:

The word public servant itself conveys the meaning that the employees are employed to serve the public. Thus, the ultimate job of the public servant is to serve public i.e. the nation and its citizen. Public welfare should be paramount in the discharge of his duties.

Yet, assuming public servant to be serving only his nation and not his family, is a farcical and impractical concept. It assumes human to be a machine with a well defined function and domain of activity beyond which there exists no world.

A true public servant is one who discharges all his duties earnestly. Family responsibilities are part of human life. A person who neglects his family manifests a moral aberration. Nation is a big family to which all the citizen belong.

Both nation and family should be served together. If a conflict arises between national service and public service then we should adopt the highest standards of integrity to avoid making compromises. While priority is nation the idea of sacrificing family is neither in the interest of job nor practically possible.

6th September 2014

Q1) "Even as the Ebola crisis rages onward in west Africa, a World Health Organization panel concluded on August 11 that offering patients promising experimental Ebola drugs with unknown side effects and efficacy would be ethical."

This is a recent news published in an American journal. Do you think it is ethical to use untested drugs on Ebola victims? Substantiate your answer on the basis of ethical principles. (200 Words)

Ans:

West Africa is experiencing the largest, most severe and most complex outbreak of Ebola virus disease in history. To make things further complicated, the Ebola drugs are not only in their experimental stage but also limited in supply.

This presents an ethical dilemma. Some call for experimental drugs to be made more widely available on a humanitarian basis, and others warning that making unproven experimental drugs widely available would be unethical.

In such a "crisis" situation, I believe it is ethical to offer unproven interventions with as yet unknown adverse side-effects, as potential treatment or prevention. However, ethical criteria must guide the provision of such interventions. These include:

1. Transparency about all aspects of care.
2. Informed consent - patient should know the pros and cons.
3. Freedom of choice - the ultimate decision rests with the patient.

4. Confidentiality and respect for the patient.
5. Preservation of dignity and involvement of the community.

Q2) Some people argue that indulging in small scale corruption is not an unethical practice if it leads to efficiency or speedy delivery of services in public offices. Do you agree with this view? Substantiate. (200 Words)

Ans:

I strongly disagree with the view that indulging in small scale corruption is not an unethical practice if it leads to efficiency or speedy delivery of services in public offices. From the point of view of public service officer, it is unethical because:

1. Violation of the ethics of duty and service to people.
2. Violation of the rights of the citizen for a transparent service delivery.
3. Rejection of office integrity for depravity and personal gain.
4. Moral turpitude replaces moral soundness.

From the point of view of a citizen, it is unethical because:

1. Corruption is self-perpetuating and such practice encourages corruption.
2. Hypocrisy - indulging in small scale corruption at the micro level, while seeking transparency at the macro level.
3. Honesty is one of the noble ideals and corruption is against the spirit of honesty.
4. Corruption is service to oneself and marginalisation of others, thus violating the fundamental duty as a citizen.

10th Sept 2014

I. A school van carrying 20 children hits a passenger bus en-route to school. Three women in the passenger bus and 4 children in the school van die on the spot. It was the fault of driver of school van who jumped the signal and hit the passenger bus. The driver of school van escapes unhurt and then escapes from the accident spot. The government announces cash relief to all the victims – dead and injured. At the same time, the government cancels recognition to the school to which the van belongs to. The police, on complaint from the aggrieved parents, arrests the principal of the school and a search party is sent to arrest the absconding driver.

1. Is government right in its actions mentioned in the case study? Substantiate. (200 Words)

2. Is it right to arrest the school principal? Explain why. (150 Words)

Government took the following decisions:

a) Announces cash relief to all the victims - dead and injured.

b) At the same time, the government cancels recognition to the school to which the van belongs to.

Since, it is already established in the case study that it was due to the fault of driver that the accident occurred. Therefore, reputation of the school that hires bus/ driver is lost to an immeasurable extent.

School authorities must have entered in to a contract for transport as per which it is the responsibility of contractor for safe travel of students to and fro home & school. Accordingly some consequential damages have also been indicated in the contract.

Therefore, the compensation amount can very well be given to victims from the contractor and therefore purpose of Government announcing cash relief to all victims- dead or injured, is defeated.

Therefore, it can be said that Govt is not right in its decision of announcing cash relief to victims. Similarly, also having established that it is a fault of driver/ contractor and assuming that all the precaution have been taken by School authorities as indicated in the contract conditions, penalising school authorities by Government by cancelling its recognition does not hold good either.

c) Is it right to arrest the Principal of the school?

It may be noted here that for any fault of driver/ contractor, Principal of the school shall not be arrested merely on the complaint of the aggrieved parents since the arrest is not justified. Rather, it will have a negative effect on the morale of the school fraternity as they might shirk off their responsibility to take decisions in future cases related to similar incidents. Therefore, stern action against driver/ contractor in violation of a contract or any legal case, whatsoever, can be initiated.

II). What are the important elements of Emotional Intelligence (EI)? Explain the importance of EI in family life. (200 Words)

Reference - 1

Reference - 2

Ans:

Emotional Intelligence like an IQ is as important factor in the determination of happiness and success of an individual or an organisation. Rather, EI contribute more to the overall growth with respect to the above parameters.

Emotional Intelligence includes as set of capabilities of being aware of what you are feeling and what others are feeling and simultaneously managing the feelings in order to motivate yourself.

EI in families has a great importance in building the basic Emotional Intelligence of children

in a family because their first school is their home where they reside with their parents, grandchildren etc who are the teachers who teach these children the art of emotional management.

Children have emotions of jovial, playful, anger or may be sadness etc. They react in a certain ways as per specific situations and depict their emotion with their gestures, smiles, expressions, sounds etc. Each and every emotion like this is required to be interpreted by parents in a correct way. That, of course, comes with the practice.

Accordingly, children must be taught how to deal or manage with the emotion so that their energy associated with such emotions can be channelized to motivate them instead of harming them.

11th Sept 2014

Q1) You are in charge of rescue operations in a severely flood hit area. Thousands of people are stranded in deep waters in their homes without food and drinking water for 3-4 days. Because of rough topography and heavy rainfall, the rescue operation is slow. When your men reach stranded people, they heckle and assault your men out of anger. One of your team members is severely injured in these fights. Your team members request you to call off operation as they are scared of facing angry people and also they are angry about the behaviour of those stranded people. At the same time, media is writing negative news about your efforts.

In such circumstances as mentioned in above case study, how will you manage the situation? For a person in your position, examine which qualities should be on display during this type of situations? (200 Words)

Ans:

Opinion supporting request of team member:

1. threat to life of team member.
2. fault of terrain rather than help team in slow response
3. demotivated team due to crowd & media reports

Opinion against request:

1. it is nature of job to have unexpected response
2. emotional & psychological toll on mental health of crowd after 3-4 days of starvation, crowd can't be blamed
3. help team is the only lifeline of rescue till it is reinforced

Course of action:

Immediate medical attention to injured team member

1. team accompanied by local leader to pacify crowd, as well as at least one doctor.
2. water and food to be primary concern of rescue operation.
3. request for reinforcement and air support to lift people by air for rescue. survivors weak due to starvation, and tough terrain- can't be rescued properly otherwise.

4. setup camps for those rescued, use local help as much as possible.
5. lead the team if possible in rescue operations to boost morale.
6. report the situation clearly and assistance required to higher authorities.

Qualities to be displayed

1. leadership to lead the team and community as a whole out of crisis.
2. motivator to rescue team after the attack on team specifically
3. networking/ co-ordinating skill to cover all aspects of rescue, order, reporting as well as deciding on critical instances.
4. emotional intelligence to deal with angry crowd.
5. hard work in crisis situation is indispensable.

12th Sept 2014

Q1) A criminal who is convicted and awarded death sentence for raping and murdering five girls, minutes before his hanging, anxiously asks a jail official if getting hanged is painful. The official tells him that it is not as painful as getting raped and murdered. The convict is hanged as per the procedure.

What ethical issues do you see in this scenario? Critically examine various arguments for and against capital punishment. (250 Words)

Ans:

“He i believe is the greatest coward, who to prove his manliness preys upon a woman”

Ethical issues involved in this scenario:

- Taking life: The man has acted brutally and murdered 5 girls. His conscience was mute as dead when he committed such heinous crimes;
- Violating personal sanctity: every individual’s body is a sacred disposition of the almighty. By outraging the modesty of these 5 girls, the man has not only violated this sacredness but humiliated the entire women race around the world.
- Violation of country’s law: Law of the land is a way to imbibe ethical values in its citizens. Laws act as a deterrent and make individuals ethical. He has violated the country’s law and thus violated each and every ethical value
- Violation of natural law: The natural law of kindness and humanity has been violated by the criminal.
- Lifelong family grievance: The criminal has not only killed the girls but also destroyed the lives of people associated with them.
- Capital Punishment: “An eye for an eye will make the whole world blind.”

The criminal committed a heinous crime by raping and murdering 5 girls, but does the act of hanging him ensure that justice would be delivered. He was mentally ill thats why he did such crime, but do we sane people should advocate the same for him?

Arguments for capital punishment:

→ Such people are threat to society. Such psychological perverts who lack conscience cant be expected to reform, since reformation requires some conscience, which this criminal lacks.

- The theory of retributive jurisdiction says that the criminal asked for the punishment by committing such crime. He is the one who demanded it. The society only obliged to his demand.
- A message has to be sent to the society that such acts won't be tolerated. Thus capital punishment would serve as a deterrent.
- The girls' family members need to be compensated for their loss.
- Prisoners' dilemma: If the maximum punishment for such crime is life imprisonment and even for committing a rape is life imprisonment, then the criminal would always try to kill the victim as he would feel that he is going to get imprisoned for life anyways, whereas if the victim dies, it is possible that his crime could never be exposed.
- US, China, Pak, India, Indonesia, Iran, Iraq and other gulf countries contribute more than 50 percent of world's population, and capital punishment exists in these countries. It means majority of the world favours capital punishment.

Arguments against capital punishment:

- Killing a criminal isn't enough. He needs to understand that what he did was wrong. For that he needs to brood over his crime and this needs time.
- No study to prove that capital punishment acts as a deterrent.
- Majority of the nations have done away with capital punishment.
- Penance is the only true punishment. Killing him in retribution won't reform the evil inside him that let him commit that crime in the first place.
- He was ill, thus he murdered those girls, but we are mentally sane, then is retribution justified?
- A capital punishment would be too easy punishment for him. It is a one time touch and go exercise.
- He committed a crime, but by killing him his entire family would be punished.

The strength of our judicial system lies in reformatory jurisdiction not retributive jurisdiction. Whatever be the crisis, focus should always be on the reform of the criminal because when a spirit reforms, so do the spirits identical to it. Thus similar criminals would take a lesson from the day to day remorse of that individual and this would lead to greater deterrence against such crimes in the society.

13th Sept 2014

Q1). You are working as Superintendent of Police. In a village which comes under your jurisdiction a gang rape has taken place. A school teacher has been raped by four youths. The parents of the lady directly complain you that the local Sub-Inspector has not registered case against those youths and moreover, when their daughter went to register a complain, he insulted and then threatened her with consequences if she went before media or made the case public. They also tell you that the lady teacher was not sent for medical check-up. Now the media doesn't know about the case, nor does the public. The parents allege that the local Sub-Inspector has taken bribe from those youth and has let them off without registering a case against them. Now the parents are saying that as a last resort they would go before the media, but they are scared about revelation of their daughter's identity and losing her job too.

In this scenario, what will you do? Explain. (200 Words)

Ans:

Issues -

- i) Allegation against SI - that he has not registered FIR, has threatened her and is accused of bribe
- ii) Parents see media as last resort due to police inaction but are afraid too

As the FIR was not registered by the SI, he is at fault. Further he's alleged to have accepted bribe and has not handled the issue sensitively. I will suspend him immediately and initiate an inquiry against him.

I will ask a lady inspector to immediately register the case and take the victim for medical check-up and to sensitively handle the victim and parents. I will further assure the parents of immediate action on the case and calm their fears about media knowing their identity which will stigmatise the social life of the family.

15th Sept 2014

I) You are working as DM of a district where illegal mining of sand is rampant. Recently there was an accident between a truck illegally carrying sand and a government passenger bus. Many passengers died on the spot because of the accident. Ever since you assumed power, you are trying to curb this illegal mining of sand. Because of negligence and involvement of police officers at local level, illegal mining is going on in many parts of the district despite your efforts to curb it. These trucks which travel on narrow village roads, have not only damaged roads, they have also caused traffic problem for passenger vehicles frequently causing accidents.

The media and some people from a political party are protesting against you after the bus accident. They are saying that you are working hands in glove with the sand Mafia. There is also an accusation that you have some personal rivalry with the Superintendent of Police. Moreover, even local media is portraying you as someone intentionally allowing illegal sand mining in the district.

In this situation, what are your options? How will you deal with accusations? And how will you manage the situation? (250 Words)

Ans:

"People will hate you, rate you, shake you and break you; but it is how strong you stand that actually makes you"

Options available to him:

- Be courageous and take responsibility to deal with the mafia.
- Request state govt to establish new machinery comprising state officials and Indian bureau of mines to deal with the problem.
- Display his inability to state govt. to control illegal mining due to poor policing.

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

"scapegoating is the easiest of all hunting expeditions. Courageous people never go for scapegoating, they owe responsibility when it's theirs to own."

Managing situation and dealing accusations:

- DM should immediately call for verification of mining leases. It needs to be verified that the miners are mining for the only resource they are authorised to do so. Also verify the period for which mining lease has been issued.
 - Call the local police officers for an explanation, issue show-cause notice them and set up a departmental enquiry. Till then, deploy different police officers in the area.
 - establish a police check point near the village road to ensure no heavy truck carrying sand is found on the dilapidated village road.
 - issue holograms and travel permits for all heavy vehicles in the district. Any heavy vehicle without a valid hologram should be seized.
 - make efforts to develop the road so that it could also carry heavy traffic.
 - involve local bodies and Panchayats for reporting of any illegal mining.
 - Brief the media about efforts to curb the illegal mining. Ensure that the SP accompanies you in the press conference to clear doubts about strained relations with SP.
 - Establish a joint working committee comprising police, you and officials of Indian bureau of mines who would verify the areas meant for sand mining.
 - approach the NGT for a verdict on banning mining in your area.
 - A strong action against the miners would only clear doubts about allegations of your association with the mafia. File an FIR regarding violation of public property, criminal negligence against the mafia and issue an arrest warrant.
 - Since he is being doubted by the media and political parties, he should be open to any departmental enquiry to ensure that people's confidence in him is restored.
 - After the action has been taken against the mafia, the DM should call for an independent social audit by media and NGO. This would reiterate the public trust in him.
- " The only tyrant one must listen to is that small voice in one's heart that tells you what is right to do. Make sure you are standing on the right ground and then, stand firm

17th Sept 2014

Q1). Rajanna had borrowed money from a private bank to buy a tractor. He was a farmer who grew sugar-cane on his two acres irrigated land. He bought the tractor from the money he had received from bank loan. He also used part of the money to pay dowry and expenses for his daughter's wedding. Owing to price drop in sugar cane in the market, he consistently defaulted on his bank loan. Fortunately he owned irrigated land and he was confident of repaying the debt within two years if the price of sugar cane improved. The bank authorities had sent him few notices. However, recently the bank decided to publish the photographs of defaulters in the public places and in local newspaper to put pressure on them. Rajanna, who was a respected individual in his village was shocked to know this and committed suicide.

After few days, the bank auctioned his tractor off too. Rajanna's wife and children have complained against the bank to the police accusing it of killing Rajanna.

1) Was it ethical for the bank to take a decision to publish photographs of loan defaulters? Explain. (150 Words)

2) Critically comment on ethical aspects of Rajanna's deeds. (250 Words)

Ans:

1). The bank decision seems to be unethical of publishing loan defaulter's photographs without informing them. This is breach of confidentiality between the bank and customers, obviously violated Right of Privacy of customer.

Before going to such act of defamation, bank neglected various options available, as following:

- a. Bank can intimate confiscation of loan property i.e. tractor
- b. Prior information to the defaulters before going for act of defamation.
- c. Court arbitration

Case also indicated he has not defaulted wilfully. Drop in the prices of sugar was the reason but he was still optimistic to repay his debt.

The bank action has undertaken decision without going to the reasons case by case. They could have restructure or increase the tenure of loan seeing the available repaying prospects before the Rajanna.

2). **Rajanna's deeds:**

- **Borrowed money to buy tractor, spent some on other things:** Rajanna's actions are both unethical and illegal. It is a violation of the contract with the bank, as banks determine the loan conditions such as interest rate after taking into consideration the reason it is taken for. So we can notice that interest rates on personal loans are usually higher than home loans or educational loans.

- **Used money for dowry:** Dowry is also illegal and unethical. It degrades the position of woman, portrays daughters as a liability on the parents and reflects a patriarchal mindset of the society. Rajanna failed to question and protest against such a denigrating institution. He was a respected individual in his village and could have refused to give dowry and convince others to not give or accept dowry too.

- **Committing suicide:** Suicides are a sad reality plaguing our country. It is against the law but firstly, it is against humanity. According to Kant, right to life is an inalienable right and a human being has no right to take away even his own life as it is granted to him by God and that human life is precious in itself.

Rajanna was crushed under humiliation but committing suicide was a selfish and cowardly act as he did not take into consideration the his family's welfare after he dies.

19th Sept 2014

You are a senior police officer working at the state police headquarters. Your wife is a Commissioner in the Higher Education Department. Recently an RTI activist has filed an RTI application seeking all the information related to purchases made by the department for the government colleges. At the behest of the minister, almost double the amount was spent by the department to purchase furniture and computers for all the state run colleges. If the real facts come out, your wife will be at risk of getting suspended and if corruption charges proved, she might even go to jail. The RTI activist is actually a close friend of yours. You come to know that he is targeting the minister in charge of the department and has nothing

Insights Ethics Case Studies and Questions – Compilation - 2014

against your wife. He also tells you that he is ready to withdraw application as a gesture of friendship.

In this situation, what will you do? Explain. (250 Words)

Ans:

1. The lady knowingly participated in the corruption. She should have shown commitment to professional integrity and refused to comply with ministerial orders. Knowing that the crime has been done you can't save your wife. Suppose every influential person tries to save his wife, how probity in public life can be established?
2. You can't ask a favour from RTI activist remember you too are holding a public office, in future he will ask you an illegitimate favour. What would you do then? Husband wife both with compromised integrity?
3. In all such cases, professional values should override personal values

Ans2:

Being a police officer, I have undertaken solemn oath to abide by the law. The case study deals with the issue of corruption. It's my constitutional duty to unearth the corrupt practices.

RTI is a potent weapon to bring the transparency. Considering this civil service virtue, I would never ask my friend to withdraw his application even if it have bearing on my spouse's career.

Minister in connivance with corrupt officials misappropriated public money. This should be investigated thoroughly.

I will discuss the matter with my wife to know about her role in the case as a commissioner in the department. If she failed to uphold the integrity and honesty, she is liable for legal action whether it may be suspension or incarceration.

It is an imperishable fact that if she found guilty my personal life would suffer. But in the larger interest of public all corrupts will face justice for their misdeeds. If she hasn't had ill intentions, natural justice takes its own course.

Public servants are custodian of people's resources. It's their constitutional and moral duty to protect and optimize them. Exemplary punishment awaits them in case of failure.

20th Sept 2014

You are the Principal of a famous government run residential school. Your son, who is studying in 12th standard in your school is extremely poor in Mathematics. Your wife is worried that if your son fails, he might slip into depression. You are also afraid that his failure would bring a bad reputation to you. You have never pressurised him to study though. Your son is good in other subjects and he is also a very good athlete in the school who has won lots of awards and medals in various competitions. Your wife is also worried that failing in 12th standard might encourage him to discontinue his studies forever. In this regard, during ongoing board exams, your wife requests you to allow him to cheat in the

exam. She requests you to talk to Mathematics teacher who is a family friend of yours to help your son during the exam. As a Principal of the college, you can do this to help your son just pass the exam.

1) What are the options available to you? (150 Words)

2) Evaluate each of these options and choose the option that you would adopt, giving reasons. (200 Words)

Ans:

1) Options available are-

- a) Let him cheat with the help of mathematics teacher
- b) Don't allow him to cheat
- c) Work on his poor part – help him to attain better command over the subject by arranging tuitions for him and also spend some time on teaching him

2)

a) if he cheats then he will probably pass the board exam which is crucial in student's life. It will also maintain the repute of my institution as I will be able to deliver 100% result. It would not tarnish my image. What would happen if people start saying that the son of the principal has failed. Moreover, my son would continue with his games in which he is master.

For short term I would escape from the wrath of my wife also for short period these choices may give me relief but in long term they will only aggravate the mental trauma that I would suffer if I choose this option. If I allow him cheating with the help of mathematics teacher it would be disastrous for his future. No one can learn from cheating. Cheating only makes you pass in the exam but in real life situation it is the experience gained in the exams helps. Exams not only test intellectual capability but also emotional intelligence that is how you respond to and make decisions in a stressed condition.

If he will not get the job than it will be more painful when people would say your son doesn't have capability. He has passed because of cheating. It will taint the institution. My integrity that demands similar treatment to all in similar situations will remain intact if I won't allow him to cheat

b) if I would not allow him to cheat than he will probably fail in the exam which may cause him slips into distress and it is possible that his career in the sports wont progress. The image of my institution to which I have duty as a principal would also suffer. So this option also doesn't seem plausible.

c) Instead, I should arrange a mathematics teacher for him and spend enough time on him, work on his weaknesses and instil a sense of confidence in him. This will protect my integrity, duties as a principal and also responsibility toward a son as a father.

29th Sept 2014

You are visiting a famous animal zoo with your husband and two children. Your family is near a lion's enclosure enjoying the view of Asiatic lion pride. Your husband is explaining to your children some interesting facts about these lions. While doing so, an 18 year old boy, standing next to your husband, starts climbing the barricade to get a full view of the pride. Unfortunately, he slips and falls into lion enclosure. Around 2-3 lions approach him and start mauling him while the public is watching with shock. Around you there are no security guards or any authorities from zoo. Few minutes later, the body of the boy is torn apart by the lions.

- 1) In situation like this, what will you do? Explain. (100 Words)
- 2) Recently an incident similar to above case study was reported in news. On whom will you put blame for the death of the boy in the above case study? Explain why. (150 Words)
- 3) At home, your husband is arguing that security guards (assuming they were around the enclosure) should have shot dead lions to save the boy. But you are putting blame on the boy himself. To support his argument, your husband is asking you what would you have done if one of your children had fallen into the enclosure – shoot lions (assuming you had fully loaded gun) or stand there watching helplessly.

In the light of above arguments, critically comment if it is ethical to kill animals to save humans? (200 Words)

Ans:

- 1) The situation is quite intense and nothing much can be done unless I have some weapon with me which maybe highly unlikely considering the checking while entering the zoo but still, since I have some time (few minutes), I can gather the public and try to pull him out by lowering some kind of a rope. Even if a rope is not present, clothes like dupatta or shirts can be tied together. Also some people could be asked to distract the lions by throwing in some food.
- 2) In the above case study the blame for the death of the boy lies mostly on the boy himself. This is because the barricades were put up there for some purpose and the purpose was to prevent people from accidentally falling into the confinement and injuring themselves. The boy intentionally climbed the barricade putting himself under risk. Nevertheless part of the blame lies with the zoo authorities also as no security guard was present at the spot showing that they were ill-prepared for any accident that might occur.
- 3) From the above argument, I believe both husband and wife have a correct opinion. Even though the blame lies with the boy for his negligence, the security guards should have performed their duty i.e. to save human life. Taking away any one's life without a substantive reason is unethical. Here we should take into account that we are dealing with a predator (the lion) who has no sympathy or compassion towards human life.

Drawing an analogy, even our courts award death sentence in rarest of rare cases where criminals disregard humanism and behave like animals. Although I believe tranquilizing

would be a better option, but if that option is not available it would be right to kill an animal to save a human life.

4th Oct 2014

As a Block Development Officer, you were invited to preside over a Gram Sabha meeting in one of Gram Panchayats falling under your jurisdiction. The Gram Sabha was called to take a decision on two crucial things: to identify and confiscate fake job cards used under MGNREGA scheme and to choose the beneficiaries to allot houses under Indira Awas Yojana. You had ordered a month ago to all Gram Panchayat secretaries to conduct programs to create awareness and advertise about coming Gram Sabha so that people would participate in large numbers.

Unfortunately, on the day of Gram Sabha to which you were invited, very few villagers turned up. It is mandatory that at least one tenth of members of Gram Sabha (those whose names are in electoral rolls) attend the Gram Sabha. But on that day less than one tenth were in attendance. At the same time, all the Panchayat members were present. They all insisted that the Gram Sabha should continue as people would slowly come and attend as the meeting progressed. Somehow you were convinced and the meeting started. Those few who attended were chosen by vote to get homes allotted after verification that they met the criteria under the Indira Awas Scheme. Job card verification was not possible as there were no people at the meeting.

Next day you received a complaint by a villager accusing Panchayat members of coercing Panchayat Secretary to conduct Gram Sabha on a date when villagers had gone out to neighbouring village to attend a festival. According to the complaint this was done to stop the identification of fake job cards, which some elected Panchayat members had themselves created to siphon off money. The complaint also alleged that you and Panchayat secretary had taken bribe from Panchayat members to conduct a fake Gram Sabha meeting. There was also allegation that beneficiaries who got allotted IAY houses were actually all relatives of Panchayat members present on the day of Gram Sabha.

- 1) Identify the major issues and your options in the case study. (150 Words)
- 2) As a responsible officer what were your duties prior to conducting Gram Sabha and what course of action you should follow after receiving the complaint. (200 Words)

Ans:

(1) Major issues are:

A) Duty of BDO: As a BDO, I am obliged to follow guidelines for conducting a Gram Sabha meeting. It was mandatory that one tenth of members of Gram Sabha attend the meeting. Therefore, until those numbers of people were present, the meeting shouldn't have started. Moreover, looking at it from a practical view, even if meeting did start with less number of people, no major decision (like allotment of houses) should have been taken. This accounts to pure negligence and dereliction of duty on the part of BDO. Best solution now should be to cancel the allotment and reschedule the meeting

B) Accusation against Panchayat members and allottees of houses under IAY: Panchayat members are accused of using official position of private gains. This is a serious allegation of corruption and it should be investigated by an independent team.

C) Accusation against BDO: There are charges of taking bribe against the BDO. As a BDO, I should hold another gram sabha meeting, cancel all allotments and try to convince people about my integrity and honesty and apologise for my negligence.

(2) Prior to conducting Gram Sabha meeting: I should make sure that people are aware of the upcoming meeting by sending some officials from my side. Moreover while conducting the meeting I should follow all procedure and guidelines.

On receiving the complaint: I should cancel all allotments and reschedule a meeting. I should order an inquiry against the panchayat members who are accused of misusing official position. I should try to convince people about my honesty and apologise for my negligence. If still people demand an inquiry against me, I should step down from the office and let the inquiry proceed in an independent manner.

